

of a judicious selection of illustrations, could have served the diocese just as well. For Davidson seems the one most willing and able to stretch the boundaries of institutional constraint and expectation, yet with the eye for the telling detail that can incorporate other stories yet to be fully told. Another reading is that this is a story of muscular Christians who did not always adapt to an increasingly urban and modern society, a church that in doing its utmost to encompass everyone found itself a series of competing congregations, committees and social groups, a story of a church that is primarily female in the pews but still led and written about primarily by men, a church that reduces the story of Māori to two separate chapters, each spanning 70 years ... the list could go on. Yet again, this is no different from any other ecclesiastical history.

What *Living Legacy* really misses is a critical engagement with the theology of the church. Peter Lineham gives some broad coverage in his chapter on the fraught issues of the charismatic revival, and Adrienne Puckey's chapter on Māori in the twentieth century likewise briefly covers the tension of creating and celebrating a distinctly Māori Anglican identity and theology. Yet this is history of a diocese in which theology appears to have little impact — or when it does is evenly glossed over by the underlying mantra of 'unity and diversity'. Where, too, is the mention of Anglican involvement in the Student Christian Movement, Christian Union or the Buchmanites at Auckland University — or indeed of the university itself? A similar excision is the Anglican involvement in participating and often leading protests against sporting contacts with South Africa, including in 1981, and the anti-nuclear movement. The Anglican history of social protest is in the main so briefly noted as to ensure it can be applauded in the case of the acceptable city mission (though it has also faced ongoing difficulties) and be safely relegated almost to footnote status elsewhere.

So why did I say this is a model for a new kind of church history? The answer is because it looks so good. This is a heavy-weight coffee-table diocesan history that is perfect for flicking through because it contains a wealth of illustrations covering paintings, cartoons, maps, photographs and charts. Adding to these aspects are brief sidebar comments and photographs that hint at what might have been, each pointing to a fascinating event or person who is included to enliven the worthy story slowly unfolding in the main body of text. So read Davidson's introduction and conclusion, look at the pictures and read the sidebars — for that, I presume, is what most of the intended readers — and especially buyers — will do. Yet this is a shame, for each chapter, written clearly and carefully for the general reader, also contains fascinating insights into the ongoing issues of Christianity and culture in this country, even if they are too often hidden in extraneous and pedantic detail. It is perhaps most limited by being, in the end, a bishop's carton of battery hen's eggs.

MIKE GRIMSHAW

University of Canterbury

Te Wiremu — Henry Williams: Early Years in the North. Edited by Caroline Fitzgerald. Huia Publishers, Wellington, 2011. 349pp. NZ price: \$45. ISBN 978-1-86969-439-5.

LAWRENCE M. ROGERS's *Early Journals of Henry Williams*, published in 1961, has long been a staple of historians of the early contact period in New Zealand. Williams was not just a keen observer of cultural interactions in the pre-annexation era, but a major player in those events. In his role as the senior member of the Church Missionary Society (CMS) in New Zealand, Williams was responsible for overturning Samuel Marsden's emphasis on civilisation as a prelude to evangelisation, sparking a more vigorous (and successful) approach to the 'conversion' of Māori to Christianity. More controversial was his hurried

translation of the Treaty of Waitangi into te reo Māori in February 1840, along with his acquisition of more than 11,000 acres of fertile Māori lands at the Bay of Islands.

His Pakaraka purchases would see Williams ignominiously dismissed from the CMS in 1849, before being reinstated a few years later. And yet, the notion that Williams was a hypocritical and deceitful figure, who preached Māori salvation while simultaneously fleecing them of their lands and tricking them into agreeing to a British takeover of their country has endured.

Caroline Fitzgerald, a great-great-granddaughter of Williams and the editor of *Te Wiremu*, knows all about her ancestor's mixed reputation. Although the purpose of the present book is not clearly outlined by her, it would appear designed to show Williams in a more positive light, largely through his own letters and journals. Quite how the book relates to Rogers's work is not explained, and nor is the methodology employed provided. We are thus none the wiser about the criteria for inclusion or exclusion of particular letters or journal entries in the book.

There are other problems with this work. While most of the material is reproduced from the letters and journals of Henry or his wife Marianne, there are also extracts from a number of other individuals, including William and Jane Williams, Richard Davis, Robert Maunsell, Samuel Marsden, and even Charles Darwin. Yet no references are provided for any of the material reproduced in the book, and it is not always clear precisely what one is reading, much less from where it has come.

Fitzgerald's introduction provides much-needed context, but it also contains a number of dubious propositions. It is misleading to suggest, as Fitzgerald does, that the Treaty was 'a hastily conceived idea of the Whig British Government' (p.4). While the Colonial Office instructed William Hobson to secure Māori consent to the transfer of sovereignty to the British, the way in which this was to be done was never clearly spelt out. It would also seem an oversimplification of matters to attribute George Grey's later attack on Williams and his land purchases solely to feeling threatened by his mana and objections to government policies. Likewise, for all of the 'French Roman Catholic' efforts to undermine Williams's reputation (p.5), fairness would surely dictate the need to add that the former naval officer was not above firing off more than a few shots of his own at Pompallier and his ragged band of priests.

A short epilogue in which Fitzgerald gives the so-called 'Littlewood Treaty' (a document that, for quite misguided reasons, is much beloved by the One New Zealand Foundation and its ilk) some credence is little better. Donald Loveridge proved beyond any reasonable doubt back in 2006 (in a document easily found online) that this was most emphatically *not* a long-lost original draft of the Treaty. The notion that it was the final draft of the Treaty is nevertheless shaping up as the twenty-first-century equivalent of the great Moriori myth.

Some of the explanatory text elsewhere also contains errors. Hongi Hika was not in England in 1818 (p.86), for example, but two years later, in 1820. Readers in search of reliable secondary accounts of Williams would, in short, be best advised to look elsewhere.

When it comes to the actual letters and journals, however, Fitzgerald's work more than amply succeeds in highlighting Henry Williams's undoubted bravery, along with his physical and mental strength in the face of frequent heavy challenges. Massive, energy-sapping journeys overland or by sea and a number of near-death encounters, either at the hands of Māori or the natural elements, read like a kind of *Boy's Own* adventure. It is difficult at times not to admire the sheer self-denial and fortitude of Williams when confronted with such circumstances. Being a missionary in pre-1840 New Zealand was not for the faint-hearted, and many lesser men (and women) found it all too much for them.

Like Rogers's earlier book, there is also ample ethnographic material here for historians of early Māori and Pākehā encounters. Marianne Williams (who Henry had presciently

declared would be travelling to New Zealand as more than a mere wife to a missionary) provides a vivid description of one early clash with their patron rangatira at Paihia, Tohitapu. Henry was constantly surprised to encounter far-flung Māori communities that had never before been visited by Pākehā, yet they were familiar with Christian karakia and the Gospel. In some cases, they had been taught to read and write by former slaves in the north, who had been permitted to return to their homes.

There is humour here, too, including Marianne's sacrifice of the missionary clothesline in 1831 in order to hoist the Union Jack at the urging of Māori as the French naval vessel *La Favorite* was imminently expected at the Bay of Islands. On another occasion a young Māori couple married by Williams each took more than ten minutes before signifying their consent to being wed. Also included is a description of the first cricket match played in New Zealand (40 to 50 players per side, the mission boys described by Henry as 'expert' bowlers).

For all of its flaws, then, *Te Wiremu* ultimately serves as a useful complement to the Rogers book (long out of print but now helpfully available on the excellent New Zealand Electronic Text Centre website). Whether one views Williams as a sinner or a saint (or even as a complex human being capable at times of acting out of self-interest even while in other circumstances proving a forceful advocate of Māori rights), there is no doubt that the ongoing debate only serves to remind us of just how central he was to the story of pre-colonial encounters between Māori and Pākehā. In this respect, it is almost certain that *Te Wiremu* will not be the last book to focus attention on this fascinating figure.

VINCENT O'MALLEY

History Works, Wellington

Taonga Māori in the British Museum. By Dorota C. Starzecka, Roger Neich and Mick Pendergrast. Te Papa Press, Wellington, 2010. 168pp. NZ price: \$99.99. ISBN 978-1-877385-76-6.

THIS LARGE (A4 FORMAT) AND EXTENSIVELY illustrated book is the result of more than a decade of effort. It exceeds its promise as 'a definitive catalogue of the British Museum's Māori collections' and as 'a valuable source of information for anybody interested in Māori culture, but most of all for the Māori people themselves who will know exactly what taonga (treasures) there are in the British Museum and what is known about them' (p.vii). This book is no ordinary catalogue. It sets a new benchmark for such endeavour. Not only does it completely address the entire British Museum collection of taonga Māori and taonga Moriori (2351 entries), but it does so with the almost flawless scholarship one has come to expect from these authors. The catalogue component is also well supported by comprehensive indices, cross-referencing and introductory narratives. The British Museum and Te Papa must be congratulated for producing the book, especially given that the Māori collections are already available 'on-line' in a very comprehensive, user-friendly format. In his preface to this volume, Neil MacGregor, the Director of the British Museum, observes that while the book offers an exhaustive and thoroughly researched account, there still remains much research to be done, and to this end the institution welcomes any corrections or additional information about catalogued items (p.vi). I love this pragmatic and interactive 'two birds with one stone' approach.

The content is certainly extraordinary. In addition to the 168 numbered pages, there are 12 pages of colour plates (96 taonga) and 100 pages of black and white plates (708