

tracks of Captain Cook'. Moving 50 years forward, one of the earliest tasks that the Historic Places Trust undertook, after its advent in 1954, was to mark some of these early sites.

When Thomas writes of 'historical conglomerates' he specifically cites the presence of memorials in some of the photographs as an example. Given this, more could be said with regard to the memorial at Ship Cove, rather than dismissing it as 'the absurd five-metre cement edifice erected in the 1920s' (p.106) and a 'gross monument' (p.107). While it may or may not be aesthetically pleasing, the monument itself functions as a narrative about the site, a narrative that represents the historical beliefs of the monument's creators. As a structure erected in the early part of the twentieth century, it is part of an upsurge in monument building that occurred between 1907 and 1920 in New Zealand. The cannons, which Thomas rejects as having nothing to do with Cook's visit, could alternatively be read as representing conquest, violence, and power. If one reimagines the monument with this analysis, quite a different picture emerges.

While these suggestions may not at first seem related to Thomas's questioning of first contact histories, most of the turn-of-century articles mentioned above discuss versions of the initial Maori-European contact, albeit from a contemporary viewpoint. With regard to the memorial at Ship Cove, some of the inscription is given in Maori. Does this express a form of cultural imperialism, the importance of these meetings to both Maori and Pakeha, or a reflection of a more bilingual early twentieth-century society than we realize? There are more layers of history and readings of histories involved here than are discussed in *Cook's Sites*.

MELANIE LOVELL-SMITH

The University of Auckland

Voyages and Beaches: Pacific Encounters, 1769–1840. Edited by Alex Calder, Jonathan Lamb, and Bridget Orr. University of Hawai'i Press, Honolulu, 1999. 344 pp. US price: \$45.00. ISBN 0-8248-2039-8.

THIS INTERESTING COLLECTION, resulting from the ninth David Nichol Smith Memorial Seminar in 1993, aspires to emulate korero, in order to 'disclose the analogies, overlaps, and to-ings and fro-ings that entangle the Polynesian and European senses of the past'. This is a lofty aspiration, but this kind of endeavour can often motivate scholars to ask new questions of their own work. The best essays in this volume use these questions to make their own voyages and 'discoveries'. The contributions are diverse, and it is not always easy to realize connections from one essay to the next. What gives the collection a sense of unity, however, is apparent in the title: the ideas of 'voyages' and 'beaches'. In the title and in many of the essays, the debt to the insights of innovative scholars such as Marshall Sahlins and Bernard Smith is apparent. In particular, many of the contributors follow 'in the wake of [Greg] Dening'.

Most scholars of the Pacific (including New Zealand) will find something of relevance or interest here. The introduction is well crafted, and shrewdly opens the way for the essays to come. J.G.A. Pocock's essay begins the collection nicely, and there are several other pieces that are insightful and thoughtful. The strongest of these essays draw upon a wide and rich variety of sources and thought. Paul Turnbull's essay on 'Enlightenment Anthropology and the Ancestral Remains of Australian Aboriginal People' is a good example. Margaret Mutu writes eloquently about the conception of 'tuku whenua'; likewise Pat Hohepa about the interweaving of Maori and Pakeha in the milieu of Hongi Hika. Smaller fields are the focus of some interesting pieces, such as Leonard Bell on a

REVIEWS

work of Augustus Earle, Rod Edmond on two missionary texts, and Mark Houlahan on Henry Tacy Kemp's translations.

Interesting paths are pursued in the essays by Malama Meleisea, Futa Helu, and 'Okusitino Mahina. These three essays share many themes. All are concerned with the relations between myth and history, and approach this larger matter through the particular. Meleisea fleshes out an often-cited but little-explored prophecy by the Samoan goddess Nafanua, which predicted the arrival of Christianity and its alliance with the lineage of Malietoa. Helu explores the Maui myths throughout Polynesia, and Mahina argues that myth is a complex dialogue, which speaks to and about both past and present. All three observe that myth had, and has, the power to challenge and change history. This theme is partly shared by David Mackay in an intriguing essay that looks at and wonders over the 'myths' that grew up alongside developing European scientific knowledge of the Pacific. He suspects these may have been just as important as the empirical (and published) findings of the voyagers.

A provocative and handsome volume, the editing and presentation are well managed. There are a few more typographical errors than is customary in a University of Hawai'i publication, noticeably in the footnotes, and the uneven use of the double vowel system of Maori orthography is confusing, perhaps doubly so for readers who are strangers to the Maori language. A few of the essays are either works in progress or not entirely new to print. In part this might be due to the long incubation period (six years between the seminar and publication). Edmond's piece is adapted from a chapter of his 1997 book; Paul McHugh's is an early version of a more substantial one to come; Nicholas Thomas's stems from his work on a new edition of Forster's *Observations*, and has appeared in two different versions in different books.

Perhaps the weakness of this collection is that notions such as *korero*, which are suggested as crucial or important, occupy less time than one might expect. These kinds of aspirations have their own species of risk, as this sort of scholarship claims as its ground the contestable parts of beach, water and hinterland. Care must be taken that scholars do not accidentally echo the colonial encounter, where the muster remained overwhelmingly on the strangers' side of the beach. Helu, Meleisea, Mahina and Mackay seem to capture best the excitement of what Pocock calls 'the possibility of reconstituting distinctive voices that can speak to each other across very divergent concepts'. This volume underscores that this task, which Pocock likens to a *marae* ('where challenges are converted into greetings and Others into Selves'), remains daunting.

TOEOLESULUSULU D. SALESA

Oriel College, University of Oxford

The Musket Wars: A History of Inter-Iwi Conflict 1806–1845. By R.D. Crosby. Reed, Auckland, 1999. 392 pp. NZ price: \$65.00. ISBN 0-790-00677-4.

ROB CROSBY'S *The Muskets Wars* successfully compiles most of the available published material on the 1800–1840 wars between Maori into one compendium, placing the events in a useful chronological order. The cartography and photographs, with the siting of tribes and battles and location of routes, are particularly good.

However, *The Musket Wars* falls victim to a number of pitfalls. The book is unreferenced, making it difficult to assess the author's accurate use of sources. Some readers will overestimate the book's authority, particularly where whole sections derive from one source. For example, the summary of Moremonui, the fight between Te Morenga