

conflict, when consciousness of statehood has been most pronounced. In a pessimistic conclusion he sees the renewed importance placed on the Treaty of Waitangi in recent years not as a sign of a more benign national condition but of renewed conflict. Following different avenues, McHugh's chapter explores narratives of constitutional development in the two societies, while Thomas provides a reading of Australian historical writing in the 1930s. Also stimulating are the contributions of Nigel Clark, Geoff Park, and John Morton and Nicholas Smith, which together examine what the editors term 'Myths of Nature'. Clark's engaging exploration of the changing notion of 'feral', in particular, suggests a new and challenging basis for future scholarship.

Contributions to the volume by Tim Rowse and Judith Binney focus on listening and meaning. Rowse examines the 1981 hearings of the Senate Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs on the proposal for a makarrata between the Commonwealth and indigenous Australians. He shows how the multiple meanings afforded to the term by indigenous Australians and politicians alike rendered the proposal politically impossible. Binney, too, is concerned with shifts in meanings, demonstrating the processes by which Maori narratives are constantly reworked and renewed through past and present to future significance.

The publication of this book, bringing together such high-quality contributions from both sides of the Tasman, is welcome indeed. At the same time, it is a reminder of how rarely and usually inadequately the closely related histories and historiographies of the two societies have been studied. Even in this collection, direct parallels and contrasts between the two nations are intermittent. Only McHugh, Rowse and the authors of the chapters dealing with nature and environment attempt to transcend national boundaries in any sustained way. When questions of national difference do arise, they are not always pursued as rigorously or fruitfully as they might have been. This was particularly evident in the contrasting chapters of Ross Gibson and Stephen Turner. Gibson's study of North Queensland emphasizes the persistence of memory among the region's settlers, and their deep disturbance at the violence of the dispossession of the indigenes — in photographs, he writes, 'their expressions [are] god-fearful and soul-dark with inarticulate malaise'. Stephen Turner's New Zealanders, however, are legatees of a culture that is forgetful, morose bearers of a 'melancholy of dislocation [that is] particularly acute'. Pakeha, he believes, are a people who 'do not know how to weep for themselves or their past'. Such divergent analyses of the two colonial experiences made me wish for a greater dialogue between the two authors, and a consideration of the shared colonial foundation of the two societies. Instead, a tone of New Zealand exceptionalism ran through Turner's chapter, exemplified in his assertion that '[i]n New Zealand . . . sport is unusually central to the individual awareness of being part of a larger culture'. Such a claim could, and has, been made equally for Australia, and no doubt for many other societies as well. Overall, though, this is a most impressive book. It contains much to delight and challenge those readers game enough to walk on the unstable terrain where the quicksands lie.

MALCOLM CAMPBELL

The University of Auckland

An Unsettled History: Treaty Claims in New Zealand Today. By Alan Ward. Bridget Williams Books, Wellington, 1999. 211 pp. NZ price: \$34.95. ISBN 0-908-912-97-8.

NEW ZEALAND, more than most nations, lives with an awareness of its past. For the last two decades, the country's efforts first to acknowledge and then to address its mishandling and wilful ignorance of the Treaty of Waitangi have been near the

forefront of the country's political and social agenda. The issue is now pervasive. Universities worry about how to accommodate Maori programme and classroom needs. The nursing profession provides training in 'cultural safety'. Politicians carefully cultivate the Maori vote. And, as Alan Ward suggests in this cogently argued volume, the entire nation finds itself wrestling with the implications of the Treaty.

An Unsettled History is presented in three parts. The first examines the nature of the 'compact' between Maori and Pakeha, documents the legacy of Maori protests about the abrogation of the Treaty, explains the origins of the 1975 Treaty of Waitangi Act, and examines the work of the Waitangi Tribunal since that time. The second part reviews the history of government mishandling of its Treaty obligations and provides a serious, scholarly and insightful analysis of the impact of this neglect on the Maori people. The short third section is perhaps the most useful and original part of the book. It assesses the Treaty of Waitangi settlement processes, criticizes both government and Maori approaches, argues that the processes require both more time (20 years) and more money (a doubling to more than \$2 billion) in order to resolve properly the outstanding grievances and claims, and provides specific recommendations on how the system might be improved. This section will likely spark considerable debate, for many New Zealanders — Maori and Pakeha alike — are anxious to have the Treaty issue resolved, 'once and for all'. As Ward contends, quick settlements, made under unrealistic time and fiscal constraints, might well be bad decisions, thus ensuring that the process drags on even longer and generates even greater hostility.

This is an important book, and it is one that must be read in its entirety for the arguments to have their full impact. Ward's claims that more resources are required and that the Treaty processes need to be strengthened only make sense in the context of his carefully drawn analysis of the long Maori struggle for recognition and the bitterness that remains among Maori. The author summarizes the conclusions of some of the major critics of Treaty processes (although he inexplicably leaves the hard-nosed, provocative, unreliable but nonetheless popular *Travesty of Waitangi* by S.C. Scott out of his discussion and out of his bibliography). He could have done more to address head-on their criticisms, which circulate widely within the country. Overall, however, this is a skilful work, revealing the hand of a scholar who cares deeply about New Zealand, has given a great deal of thought to the future of Maori-Pakeha relations, and who combines academic detachment with direct personal involvement with the Treaty of Waitangi process. Equally, Ward has opted to let the events of the past speak without excessive embellishment. *An Unsettled History* provides a well-researched and carefully argued analysis of the evolution of Maori-Pakeha relations, with special emphasis on the promises and betrayals associated with the Treaty.

One wonders, even agreeing with Ward's strongly worded and compelling analysis, whether the route that is outlined and supported in *An Unsettled History* holds such clear promise for success. Legal processes, through the courts, tribunals or negotiated settlements, invariably involve conflict and compromise. The results are rarely greeted with universal enthusiasm, and can often leave bitter feelings between and within the Maori and Pakeha populations. New Zealanders need to realize that a return to the 'political compact' represented by the Treaty would bring about a marked shift in national priorities and would not, in all likelihood, be widely applauded in the Pakeha community. Ward argues that strengthening the Treaty process is essential to building a 'harmonious nation'. He may well be right, although it is clear that the Treaty of Waitangi process can and has been both a motivation for change and accommodation and a reason to avoid movement on exactly these issues. Resolving the legacy of New Zealand's past will take far more, and will require a much wider consensus on the merits and nature of biculturalism, than paying close heed to the legal and moral obligations of the Treaty of Waitangi.

The issues that Ward raises are not unique to New Zealand, despite Maori and

Pakeha leaders seeing the struggle almost exclusively in national terms. No country has yet managed to build solid, well-balanced relationships between indigenous peoples and newcomer populations. In the community of nations, however, New Zealand is clearly at or near the front. While profound difficulties remain, the irony is that Maori-Pakeha relations in New Zealand are, in comparative international terms, among the very best. Without understating or ignoring the difficulties — and they are real — the pattern of social, economic, political and cultural relationships in New Zealand reflect credit on both the Maori and Pakeha communities. There is not a shadow of a doubt, as Ward documents, that the Maori population bears a hugely disproportionate share of the cost of the failures of that relationship, and that therefore a great deal remains to be done. But in the process of addressing the outstanding Treaty obligations and of continuing to build on the country's legacy of Maori-Pakeha co-operation, it is important that New Zealanders recognize, and take credit for, their accomplishments to date.

Maori concern with rangatiratanga (self-determination) and the related demand for 'sovereignty' has raised fears among Pakeha that the Treaty process will be without end, and that Maori aspirations will expand, rather than be resolved through negotiations. Ward does not cover this theme in detail, but he does offer a calming assessment of Maori expectations and a realistic appraisal of what rangatiratanga means in practical terms (and not in the rhetoric of the relatively small number of Maori radicals, whose words have the potential to inflame relations). Pakeha will, in time, see the wisdom in Ward's careful advocacy of greater acceptance of Treaty settlements and self-determination and will, in all likelihood, see the collective benefit from returning to Maori a level of control that has long been central to their political existence.

Alan Ward's most important assertion is a simple one: 'the sky has not fallen — and nor is it going to — as a result of Treaty claims being heard and settled'. Much as Canadians, Americans and Australians recoil at large land claim or treaty payments, so a significant portion of the New Zealand population questions the need for settlements under the Treaty of Waitangi. If the country takes a longer view — looking several generations into the future instead of obsessing about current conditions — one can see in these settlements the key building blocks of a new Maori-Pakeha relationship. New Zealand will not be bankrupted by the agreements. And, as Ward is careful to point out, unsupportable Maori claims — the ones that really get the talk-show hosts upset — do not result in Treaty settlements. Addressing the injustices of the past is not easy, but nor is it avoidable. New Zealand has, as Ward argues, an enviable opportunity to do so in a spirit of reconciliation and co-operation. Many countries around the world would happily accept the opportunity available to the Maori and Pakeha people of New Zealand.

KEN COATES

University of New Brunswick

Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples. By Linda Tuhiwai Smith. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 1999. 208 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877133-67-1.

DECOLONIZING METHODOLOGIES consists of a sequence of overlapping essays which address two particular themes. The book begins with a scathing critique of the ways in which research into indigenous peoples has been conducted in the past, driven by ideas