

women's routine domestic labour, walking a fine line between nostalgic recreation of the past and sentimental antiquarianism. There is also humour. One of Queen Victoria's 'remarkably unattractive' thick brick-red crocheted scarves, presented to a New Zealand veteran of the Boer War, is featured on p.61. The material on children's crafty efforts is generally comical without being patronizing. On p.226 there is a lovely child's impression of a knitting pattern, 'stitch stitch stithole st oh st bother!! stitch, stitch'.

Nicholson does make some missteps though. More attention could have been paid to translating knitter's jargon for non-knitting readers and to converting pre-metric measurements. How many non-knitters know what a fingering yarn is, for instance, let alone appreciate the effort required to knit 'an ounce of 4-ply in stocking stitch in two hours', or to earn '1s per 1-ounce skein of 2-ply yarn' making baby clothes on number 12 needles (p.106)? In the absence of good evidence for the early period of Pakeha history the author sometimes slips into irrelevancies. The army surgeon Morgan Grace arrived in New Zealand not wearing a knitted jumper (p.58). The book also occasionally displays its origins as a photocopied 'family' history, as at the beginning of Chapter Two where the immigration of the author's great-great-grandmother (who may or may not have knitted) is chronicled. There are also intrusive contemporary asides about how 'almost anything or nothing' has become acceptable wear on television (p.66). Most seriously, the 'rise and fall' narrative structure contains an internal contradiction in that Nicholson wants to acknowledge the hardships that drove her forebears to knit so much and labour so long, while simultaneously lamenting the decline of knitting and spinning into minority hobbies following their liberation from the needle through the advent of cheap, mass-produced clothing. Sights, real or imagined, against the knitters of the world are refuted with vigour. The project was partially funded by a grant from the 1993 Suffrage Centennial Trust and the introduction begins by reliving the criticisms of the Trust's choice from a group of social studies teachers and TV3's now defunct current affairs show, the Ralston Group. She chides those who would dare to laugh at Naomi Lange's pink cardie or Grandma's clacking needles and claims that keeping busy is now in 'our genes' due to thousands of years of selection for marriage on the basis of skill with spindle and needle (pp.7, 274). The defensive tone and the biological determinism let the book down. The text provides eloquent testimony to the historical and social importance of yarncraft; no special pleading was needed.

DEBORAH MONTGOMERIE

University of Auckland

Chips off the Auld Rock: Shetlanders in New Zealand. By Susan Butterworth with Graham Butterworth. Shetland Society of Wellington, Wellington, 1997. 251 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 0-473-046-73-3.

Far Off in Sunlit Places: Stories of the Scots in Australia and New Zealand. By Jim Hewitson. Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, 1998. (First published in Great Britain by Canongate Books, Edinburgh, 1998). 308 pp. Aust price: \$29.95. ISBN 0-522-84833-8.

LAST YEAR, as part of their assessed coursework, students of New Zealand history studying at stage one level at the University of Waikato were required to choose and review for their peers a recently published book on any topic mentioned in the course text, provided that the chosen publication met a few basic scholarly criteria. We would have welcomed the Butterworths' book on the history of Shetland Islanders in New Zealand for this class because a discussion of its themes and methods would be

instructive and of interest to our students. Had a student failed to read the assignment specifications properly and proffered Jim Hewitson's unsourced collection of stories for selection, this choice would have been rejected by the tutors at the outset.

As part of celebrations to mark the 75th anniversary of its founding in 1922, the Shetland Society of Wellington commissioned the Butterworths to write a history of the Shetland connection with New Zealand. The result is a book which succeeds on many levels. It offers its readers a concise, intriguing and accurate overview of Shetland's place in the world (literally one-third of the way between the northern mainland of Scotland and the west coast of Norway) and the unique geographical and political circumstances which moulded its economy and culture. For all those interested in the diversity of origins of nineteenth- and twentieth-century immigrants to New Zealand, this book opens another window. New Zealanders with Shetland ancestry are likely to find one of their forebears here, if not in the text or case-studies, then in the useful set of appendices. As well as offering an explanation and interpretation of the Shetland Society of Wellington's changing activities and membership over time, the main narrative surveys the pattern of Shetland migration and settlement in New Zealand. There are also four photo-essays which provide an evocative depiction, 'a flavour', of typically Shetland crafts and accomplishments which found expression in New Zealand contexts: stonemasonry, musicianship, boating and knitting. (Trades connected with the sea and the domestic production of finely worked hand-knits produced for a luxury market were the main activities which linked Shetlanders into the cash economy of mainland Britain last century.) The authors' device of setting a large proportion of their case-studies outside the main body of the text means that the narrative is sustained. The book is beautifully written: to Susan Butterworth goes the credit for its simple, clear and incisive prose. It is generally well (at times overly) referenced, although there are also occasions when a reference is omitted or is frustratingly inexplicit, for example, the Rev. Charles Ogg's statement about Shetlanders (p.68) and most instances when the authors supply population details pertaining to the sending region (for example, pp.30, 39).

The latter omission is possibly to mask the authors' lack of familiarity with Scottish primary sources. Given the scope and purpose of their book, this criticism of the Butterworths' research is unfair. Yet it is important if their work is to be taken seriously (as indeed it should) for its contribution to the academic study of migration, given as a secondary aim. Emigration rates from Shetland in the middle years of the 1870s were massively high and it is fascinating that for the most part this exodus was headed for destinations in New Zealand. There are at least three occasions when the Butterworths give the nineteenth-century population of Shetland as 31,000, and on each of these occasions the text implies a different base year for this figure: 1851, 1861 and 1871 respectively. Given the smallness of Shetland's population, even a small variation in the base population or the numbers leaving can make a substantial difference to the emigration rates. Use of the published Scottish census figures pertaining to Shetland would have lent precision here.

My choice of the word 'Scottish' (rather than 'Shetland' or 'British') in the preceding paragraph is deliberate and only partly because the power of nineteenth-century states to collect, systematize and record information pertaining to their citizens on a vast scale was exercised in a particular manner by the Scots. As the Butterworths' text shows, Shetland became part of Scotland by a process of colonization that did not begin effectively until as late as the sixteenth century. No wonder that variations on the 'Up-Helly-Aa', a colourful pageant involving torch-bearing Viking squads and the ceremonial burning of a replica Viking galley, have been the favoured means of expressing a flamboyant sense of distinct identity still felt by members of the Shetland Society of Wellington. The Butterworths point out on the first page of their

introduction that Shetlanders are not Scots and they do not refer to their place of origin as 'the Shetlands'. However most people who live in Scotland also absorb these distinctions and have an awareness of the plurality of Scottish culture. (Incidentally, most people who live in Scotland do not refer to the Orkney Islands or Orkney as 'the Orkneys', cf. Butterworth, pp.11, 16.) The reinvention of the tradition of 'Up-Helly-Aa' in Shetland itself in the 1880s occurred largely as a response to the integration of Shetland with the mainland economy, a process due to three factors: the rise of Lerwick merchants (the background from which Sir Robert Stout emerged), developments in the annual herring fishing, which became highly capitalized although still a seasonal activity, and the involvement of huge proportions of male Shetlanders in the merchant navy. The 'Up-Helly-Aa' summoned the men home from the sea in time for spring ploughing. Because most of the work on the crofts was done by women, the men were still able to join the haaf fishing between May and August. The permanent and temporary migration of Shetlanders to New Zealand in the nineteenth century did not disrupt this pattern of economic development and was initiated by the very same factors. However, the large emigration of Shetlanders which occurred for a brief period in the mid 1870s was due also to eviction and clearance, a process which could be reconstructed (and so inform at least two historiographical traditions) using a combination of New Zealand and Scottish sources. If Shetland's economic and cultural ties had been mainly with Norway in this period, most Shetland emigrants would have gone to the United States.

Jim Hewitson's book on the Scots in Australia and New Zealand is a good source of Scots/English jokes and might be useful for people thinking of taking groups of homesick Scots on bus tours. In that context it would not matter if the details are a bit wrong: they cannot be checked out using this book, as it provides no footnotes. There are some interesting illustrations, one example being a reproduction (presumably from the National Library of Scotland) of 'Johnstons' Emigration Map' of the Auckland province, published in Edinburgh and London in 1876. The author is emphatic that his book is not an 'academic' or 'genealogical' work but a collection of 'wonderful wee anecdotes' which he found appealing. Much of the material he draws upon is intrinsically interesting but it is scarcely organized. The case-studies are grouped together roughly, according to undefined themes. These themes dictate the chapter divisions, which have exciting titles like 'Killed, Cooked and Eaten' (which appears to be about race relations) and 'Whores and Hard Cases' (which does not discuss women but gives some examples of convict settlers, rascally folk-heroes and ne'er do wells). Unfortunately the author interrupts his stories from time to time with a pseudo-academic commentary. Hewitson has been to a few conferences and dipped into a few books, and he presents ideas from these in a completely uncritical way seeking no connection between his evidence and the 'arguments'. The discursive element in the book is dense with contradiction. For example, he claims that Scots immigrants were distinctive for their willingness to inter-marry with other ethnic groups (no evidence) while in the paragraph immediately following he states: 'critics have detected' that the Scots were 'clannish' (p.10).

Why did Melbourne University Press publish Jim Hewitson's book? It would not be touched by an academic publishing house in Edinburgh. Susan and Graham Butterworth's thoughtful and thought-provoking work published by a New Zealand local Shetland society merits far wider attention.

ROSALIND McCLEAN

University of Waikato