

Columbia, where we are trying to resolve First Nations' Land Claims without benefit of treaty, the two processes of stating and attempting to resolve the issue are being run together. First Nations' concerns about whether the other levels of government will really understand the extent of the historical grievance hinders the negotiation of a resolution. The Waitangi Tribunal believes that it has written a report rather than a judgment, and in judicial terms it is probably right. But the Muriwhenua report does present a clear judgement on history as its authors hold the New Zealand government responsible for the improper dispossession of Maori in Northland.

While it is important that the issue be clearly stated, that is only the first step in a long process. Lasting resolutions of land claims will have to be political, rather than judicial or quasi-judicial, and they involve the hard issues of access to resources and the future of people's livelihoods. And that, as we are now learning in British Columbia, is when the going really gets tough.

ROBIN FISHER

University of Northern British Columbia

Nga Patai: Racism and Ethnic Relations in Aotearoa/New Zealand. Edited by Paul Spoonley, Cluny Macpherson and David Pearson. The Dunmore Press, Palmerston North, 1996. 300 pp. NZ Price: \$44.95. ISBN 0-86469-266-8.

NGA PATAI The Questions, is the third book in a series that began in 1984 with *Tauiwī* and continued in 1991 with *Nga Take*. Many of the themes raised 16 years ago remain in what has become a discourse on racism and ethnic relations. This conversation by New Zealand academics and researchers with other New Zealanders on the issues of race and ethnic identity is developed further in *Nga Patai*. The authors describe and develop an understanding of recent policy developments by highlighting a number of issues at the core of political and popular debate in the late 1990s. In this they succeed because the reader becomes engaged in an intellectual debate with each writer-commentator over the analysis and the conclusions offered. At the same time we are all left with further questions. The book is aptly named.

The book's value is in the diversity of writers and their analysis of current policies and trends. A third of the original *Tauiwī* writers are in *Nga Patai* thus providing the necessary continuity for the discourse. There are 16 contributors in the collection of 14 essays — Patrick Ongley, Ravi Palat, Paul Spoonley, Michael Reilly, Evan Poata-Smith, Robert Mahuta, Cluny Macpherson, Avril Bell, Wendy Larner, Jane Kelsey, Juan Tauri, Graeme Smith, Linda Smith, Judy McGregor, Joanne Te Awa and David Pearson.

The book is divided into three parts. The first discusses migration, the political economy and racialization. The second addresses the politics of difference, and the third, institutional policies and options. The range of policies covered and the passion of the debates emphasizes the complex nature of race and ethnicity in Aotearoa/New Zealand today. The authors engage us all in debates on immigration, particularly the growth of Asian immigration; on ethnic relations and identity formation of Pakeha, Asian, Pacific Island and Maori groups; on employment and the phenomenon of the racialization of work; on the use of history in New Zealand ethnic identity making; on the evolution of Maori protest; on Tainui as a case study of iwi development; on gender theories and ethnicity; on the role of a media capable of meeting the needs of diverse communities of

interest; on four current myths in Maori education and the idea that in supporting a Maori agenda at one level, it may work against Maori at another; on Treaty policies and the evolution of Aotearoa New Zealand society; and finally, on bicultural and multicultural concepts and policies which shape society.

A number of tantalizing themes quickly becomes apparent to the reader, but I will mention only three. One of the most powerful themes is an analysis and discussion on the process of 'racialization' and its emergence in our brand of political economy, and globally. Discussed in the first three chapters, the process can be seen in New Zealand immigration policies involving Pacific Island and Asian immigrants where their supposed racial distinctiveness is invested with negative perceptions based upon their economic status. In this view the immigrants are believed to be responsible for a host of social problems, the competition for jobs, or the fears of a large-scale influx.

Another dimension of the process is argued by Paul Spoonley: 'work has been racialised in New Zealand, both in terms of a historical process that began with European colonisation and in terms of recent economic developments' (p.76). The argument is that, in fundamental ways, the labour market and access to paid work is marked by 'racial' distinctions and that these inevitably lead to marginalization. For Spoonley, the divide between Maori and Tangata Pasifica and other New Zealanders reflects the way in which the labour market has been racialized in recent years. It is not accidental. The process of racialization raises a number of theoretical questions, such as, how to explain what has happened in the New Zealand economy and society, given the extensive changes that have taken place. The contention of this school of analysis is that racial capitalism, or the racialized nature of contemporary production, is worthy of serious enquiry. I agree. Fortunately other centres of research are beginning to put the spotlight on the idea that racism is a contagion in the capitalist economy. It is currently being studied by a group of Afro-American economists and other social scientists at the Roy Wilkins Centre, University of Minnesota.

The debate is timely because Maori endeavours to enter the market place as active players through the management of tribal assets and the creation of wealth, and the emergence of a distinctive private sector consisting of Maori businesses and entrepreneurs, raises a question as to whether Maori and/or iwi economic development will differ in any way from the economic, social and cultural goals of Pakeha in the market place. Further, will Maori be the architects of their own racialization and the maintainers of marginalization? Robert Mahuta in his discussion on the positive side of iwi development suggests that, coupled with economic development, future tribal governments based on kinship must be replaced by alternative tribes. Membership of these new tribes will be defined through electoral rolls and the ballot box. Hopefully, Maori political development will enable checks and balances to be placed on the nascent Maori capitalist economy.

A second theme involves questions about the longer term positive and negative outcomes offered by biculturalism and multiculturalism. This is highlighted by David Pearson, who asserts that while ethnic relations in Aotearoa/New Zealand are distinctive, comparative studies point to bi- and multiculturalisms as being both liberating and constraining. His studies warn us that we should be wary of any chauvinistic culturalist perspective because it may mask a complex basis of inequality. A question can therefore be asked, has the time come in our bicultural and multicultural discourses to think beyond the culturalisms?

A third theme is a healthy critique of the current economic focus of policy in New Zealand. This philosophy of economism lacks a humanistic orientation. It rejects the New Zealand humanist tradition embodied in the welfare state. The rise of new right and libertarian policies has led to the demise of the humanism inherent in both Maori and Pakeha traditions and it also represents one of the fundamental ethical and moral shifts

in our history since the 1840s. According to the monetarist view, New Zealand people exist for the economy, rather than the economy for the people of New Zealand. Without explicitly stating it, the authors in this book are advocating the bringing together of humanity and economy. In recent years, Dame Miraka Szazsy proposed such an agenda when speaking to Maori graduands at Victoria University of Wellington. Concerned about the economic tendencies among the new Maori leaders, she argued for a new Maori humanism. Her plea also applies to the country as a whole, particularly to our political and business leaders. A renewed, revitalized New Zealand humanism, drawing on the creative diversity of cultures and peoples now living here, could be a basis for humanizing our current dehumanized economy.

MANUKA HENARE

The University of Auckland

Lands for the People? The Highland Clearances and the Colonisation of New Zealand: A Biography of John McKenzie. By Tom Brooking. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 1996. 363 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877133-21-3.

JOCK MCKENZIE (1838-1901), the big Highlander who became Liberal Minister of Lands, is a part of New Zealand's folk myths, partly as a result of confusion with an earlier James McKenzie who rustled some sheep and found land in the upper Waitaki, also perhaps because of a gaggle of other politicians called M(a)cKenzie, of somewhat lesser significance. It was Jock who broke up (or 'burst' up as they said in the 1890s) the great estates — a land, rather than a sheep, stealer. And, if he only became acting Prime Minister while Seddon was in Britain, his near decade as Ministers of Lands and Agriculture made him a political force second only to Seddon.

Thus, 25 years ago, McKenzie seemed an ideal thesis topic for Tom Brooking. At last the work has come to the fruition of a full book, although the focus has moved. Certainly the book is a biography, especially of McKenzie's early life in the Highlands, where his family's status was somewhat higher than the myth's impression of a landless crofter. But for most of the book the private man gets submerged below the minister, although there are delightful glimpses of his family life in the penultimate chapters. Without being 'unwise' he was certainly the laird towards his children.

The first subtitle is the twist in the story. Certainly McKenzie, scarred by the Scottish Highland clearances, came to New Zealand and broke up the large South Island estates, giving lands to the people. But the North Island highlands were still possessed by Maori, and in a sense the Minister of Lands replicated the Scottish clearances there, a further 2.2 million acres being alienated from their native owners. The size of the loss is nicely illustrated by two *Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives* maps of Maori land holdings in 1892 and 1908, although regrettably they are reproduced on two non-facing pages, which makes visual comparison difficult.

The story of bursting up the land is central to the book, with over half the text devoted to it, and some useful detail in the appendices. This is not simply a report of the events, for a whole chapter is devoted to 'the land debate'. Land policy was at the heart of the nineteenth century's populist economics. Brooking unravels much of that debate, along lines similar to his recent *New Zealand Journal of History* article,¹ which in some ways is more satisfactory because it integrates the approach towards settler estates with those