

chapter six, was not without its contemporary critics: one can only wish that modern-day detractors of Asian migrants would follow the lead of the *Tuapeka Times* of March 1885 in challenging social hypocrisy.

In addition to the detailed use of Presbyterian church records and Don's written and photographic evidence, Ng has made extensive use of AJHR reports, Warden's Court papers, newspapers, statistical data, personal reminiscences and police records, local histories, maps, and family genealogies — and this list is by no means complete — but in volume two, as in the earlier parts, the footnotes are not just an acknowledgment of the sources used. They are also the means by which a dedicated researcher has sought to make available to his community of readers all the supplementary evidence that he has been able to gather on the Cantonese migrants. The double-column format and the generous font size greatly assist a reader's foray into the footnotes and the publisher's willingness to allow such extensive commentary has transformed the references from a necessary appendage to a richly-documented sub-text. These footnotes are written to be read and to do so is a rewarding experience.

A work of this magnitude could not have been undertaken, let alone completed, without family and community support and these debts are readily acknowledged. This volume affirms the co-operative nature of scholarly endeavour, an approach which advocates of user-pays research practices have clearly never understood. Both author and publisher can take pride in the fact that their combined talents and dedication have produced an enduring outcome.

JEANINE GRAHAM

University of Waikato

Making Men: Rugby and Masculine Identity. Edited by John Nauright and Timothy J.L. Chandler. Frank Cass, London, 1996. 260pp. UK price: £35.00 hb. ISBN 0-7146-4637-7.

The Game of Our Lives: The Story of Rugby and New Zealand and how they've shaped each other. By Finlay Macdonald. Viking, Auckland, 1996. 138pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 0670-869074.

THESE TWO BOOKS present something of a dilemma. While *Making Men* undoubtedly carries the greater academic credentials, its coverage of New Zealand rugby is clearly its weakness. *The Game of our Lives* — the book of the recent television series — hints at a more up-to-date analysis. Yet its journalistic tendency towards generalization, and especially its lack of referencing, place obvious limitations on its academic value.

Making Men sets four tasks in attempting to unravel the white male hegemony of rugby. Firstly, by focusing on the most traditionally 'manly' team sport, it seeks to add to historical analysis of the significance of gender in sport. Secondly, it examines the relationship between rugby and institutions of social power in Britain, Australia, New Zealand and South Africa from the late nineteenth century onwards. Thirdly, it traces the diffusion and different adaptations of rugby in these countries and the diverse meanings that were attached to the game by contrasting cultures. Finally, as a purely descriptive account, *Making Men* aims to fill significant gaps in the existing social history of rugby.

These objectives are met with varying degrees of clarity. The gender analysis,

especially, is often more implied than explicitly stated. To highlight a structure which marginalizes the participation of women, is not the same as to explore the attitudes of women to that structure or the specific attitudes of rugby authorities to the notion of participation by women. Nevertheless, there is much here that will provide a valuable comparative model for the future historical study of New Zealand sport.

Timothy Chandler traces the origins of rugby in the English public schools, its formal codification during the 1860s, and the élite social context wherein the manner of the game assumed as much, if not more, importance than the game itself. James Martens follows this evolution through to the split between élite and northern working-class rugby (league) during the 1890s. Marking a further departure from the élite ideal, David Andrews provides an excellent analysis of the centrality of rugby to the Welsh cultural renaissance between 1890 and 1914 and the dual sense of Welsh nationalism and British imperialism which accompanied it.

The imperial diffusion of the game took many forms. Robert Morrell examines the place of rugby in insulating the values of the white middle-class against the majority black population in colonial Natal. Albert Grundlingh reveals the powerful and enduring links between rugby and Afrikaaner nationalism during the twentieth century. Murray Phillips explores contrasting class responses in the nexus between rugby and war in New South Wales up to 1918.

Jock Phillips' account of the growth of New Zealand rugby is less convincing. As a reprint of part of a chapter from *A Man's Country* it is disappointing that this contains several errors from both editions of that book — not least the crucially misleading claim that there were 50,000 (rather than 5000) affiliated players in New Zealand by the mid-1890s. Phillips describes a game which spread rapidly from the towns and won ready acceptance among those accustomed to a physically demanding rural work environment. He draws heavily on Dunning and Sheard's discussion of working-class rugby and its 'physicality' among the mining and mill communities of northern England. But as *The Game of our Lives* points out, the origins of New Zealand rugby, its formalization and administration, were predominantly an urban enterprise. While it is easy to find teams in a wide variety of rural areas, such as those listed for 1876, this does not tell us how long they endured. Even in the cities, a combination of limited facilities, limited funds and apathy ensured that numerous clubs failed for every one that survived. Sustained rural growth only occurred towards the end of the nineteenth century when more reliable transportation networks were set in place.

Thus the notion of rugby as a means of obtaining physical contact in a frontier, male environment is equally questionable. To portray the scrum as an 'organised hug' may be provocative sociology with a certain applicability to the 1870s — a time when rugby, and the rural game especially, was sporadic at best. But it misrepresents the rapidly expanding code, rural or otherwise, of the late 1880s in which rule changes shifted the emphasis from brute force to a dependency on skill in open play. Such chronological distinctions are important when attempting to generalize. Moreover, Phillips' only evidence for the 'contact' theory is to quote Thomas Eyton's apparent reminiscence of players rubbing liniment on each other during his playing days. In fact this is a reference to Eyton's difficulties as manager of the 1888 New Zealand Native team — when the cancellation of two over-subscribed medical insurance policies forced his players to conduct their own treatment. One also wonders at the convenient misprint whereby an 1889 exhortation to more skilful play — 'to think more and bullock less' — becomes 'think more and buttock less'.

What remains is a convincing explanation of the suitability of the New Zealand climate for rugby and, more importantly, its growth through networks established by English

public school old boys. Phillips also provides a good sketch of the struggle to purge rugby of its earlier violent excesses, bad language and gambling. Indeed, more could be made of the fact that although many New Zealanders embraced a public school game, fewer of them embraced its accompanying morality.

This is a point notably absent from John Nauright's efforts to place the 1905 All Black tour within the fabric of post-Boer War British physical deterioration debates. It is true that the remarkable endeavours of the team were seized upon in some quarters, and most notably by R.J. Seddon, as proof that the quality of Empire manhood had not deteriorated in the colonies, as it apparently had in Britain. But at the same time there was heated criticism during the tour of the All Blacks' over-vigorous and apparently obstructive play — particularly that of their controversial wing-forward. Earlier breaches of conduct by the Native team, the sending of an Anglo-Welsh team to New Zealand in 1908 — essentially to buttress the fragile amateur ethos of rugby in the dominion — and the long gap between New Zealand tours to Britain (1888, 1905, 1924), suggest that British perceptions of New Zealand rugby were less than idolatrous. Given that the Edwardian athletic ideal stressed the interdependence of a healthy body and a healthy mind, these objections cannot be glossed over in favour of a monolithic focus on reactions to the purely physical merits of the All Blacks. Discussion of the links between sport, imperialism and nationalism prior to 1914 must take account of different, class-based, ideologies.

In two final chapters Nauright and David Black examine the contentious terrain of All Black-Springbok rugby contacts and the powerful nostalgia which insulated rugby against an increasing wave of contrary opinion. This is a good summary — especially valuable for overseas readers — but it provides nothing new for scholars familiar with the territory. Although frequent reference is made to 'counter-hegemonic struggle', and the writings of Christine Dann and Shona Thompson in particular, the coverage falls short of the initial billing.

In the nature of television *The Game of our Lives* moves quickly over much ground — highlighting main themes but not contexts. Nevertheless, the mix of anecdote, interview and secondary research captures the diversity of New Zealand rugby and its pervasive influence — 'pervasive' being both positive and negative. More than the televised version, this is a popular account which goes some way to challenging myths and examining divisions, especially with regard to South Africa. It remains for future researchers to transform its vignettes. In this, the stronger contributions from *Making Men* will provide a good comparative model.

GREG RYAN

University of Canterbury

Bible and Society: A Sesquicentennial History of the Bible Society in New Zealand. By Peter J. Lineham. The Bible Society in New Zealand and Daphne Brasell Associates Press, Wellington, 1996. 302pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 0-908896-46-8.

BIBLE AND SOCIETY is at once a tribute to the Bible Society and its supporters, an account and critique of their achievements, and a reflection on the changing status of the Bible — and of the Bible Society — in New Zealand. Its publication marks the one hundred and fiftieth anniversary of the founding of the Auckland Auxiliary of the British and Foreign Bible Society (BFBS) in 1846. Subsequently other auxiliaries were established, each