

Windows on a Chinese Past, Volume 2. By James Ng. Otago Heritage Books, Dunedin, 1995. 356pp. NZ price: \$125.00. ISBN 0-908774-61-3.

VOLUME TWO, covering chapters three to six of the projected four-part *Windows on a Chinese Past*, maintains the standards of scholarship and book production for which the first two published volumes, one and four, have already been widely acclaimed. By a skilful interweaving of documentary, visual, statistical and oral evidence, James Ng first provides an intricate account of the Chinese mining settlement at Round Hill in Southland during its heyday and subsequent decline. Personalities, customs, court cases and production, the changing technology of mining and its associated environmental impact, the centrality of water supplies: the text is as comprehensive as the research is exhaustive. Chapter four focuses on the Reverend Alexander Don, Presbyterian missionary to the Chinese goldminers in Otago, founder of the Canton Villages Mission in 1898, and compiler of the remarkable notebook recording details of 3,628 individuals (reproduced in volume four). Mixed marriages in both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries are the focus of chapter five, while chapter six, subtitled 'The Evil of Opium', provides a salutary reminder that the rhetoric of allegation and assumption bore little relationship to the actual evidence.

Until very recently, writings on the Chinese in New Zealand have reflected a European perspective. This work is all the more important because it is a viewpoint from within. A significant cultural minority in New Zealand at last has its own historian and the analysis both of the Chinese miners' experiences in New Zealand and of Alexander Don's missionary endeavours is far richer as a consequence. The missionary's writings during his 'distraught' periods of 1884-86, 1889-90, 1893-95, are carefully analysed and the impact of these times of personal depression are investigated, both in the chapter on Round Hill and, more extensively, in the section on Don himself. His lack of rapport with leaders of the Chinese community was an undoubted handicap at the time but proved to be of inestimable advantage for historians since Don's focus on the three and a half thousand 'ordinary' miners provided the documentary foundation for Ng's subsequent researches. Energy, commitment and dedication notwithstanding, the missionary baptized no more than twenty Chinese migrants, including some who were already converted by others. In religious terms, Don's mission in New Zealand was a failure, essentially because 'until late in his mission — and not really even then — he lacked the humility, forbearance, sense of humour, security and flexibility of character to be a successful missionary'. The judgement is a considered one, reached after close examination of Don's relationship with the miners and their kin.

Don's decision to 'take his evangelism to the home villages of those who had generally spurned his message in New Zealand' resulted in the formation of a mission to the Upper Panyu district of Guandong Province. Renamed the South China Mission in 1937-38, this enterprise continued until 1951. Although Ng comments that a comprehensive history of the mission is yet to be written, his analysis of its inherent weaknesses and the detailed noting of available records should ensure that the research suggestion is not long ignored.

Chapter five's treatment of mixed marriages is rich in personal detail. Don himself opposed such liaisons, maintaining that they were generally detrimental to one or both parties, with Chinese males usually the prime losers. Ng explores the issues through to the present day, and in the process provides contemporary New Zealanders with a very timely perspective on the current immigration debate. Some readers may find the level of author comment intrusive but the social contribution of Chinese-New Zealanders deserves public acclaim. Late nineteenth-century prejudice over opium and gambling, outlined in

chapter six, was not without its contemporary critics: one can only wish that modern-day detractors of Asian migrants would follow the lead of the *Tuapeka Times* of March 1885 in challenging social hypocrisy.

In addition to the detailed use of Presbyterian church records and Don's written and photographic evidence, Ng has made extensive use of AJHR reports, Warden's Court papers, newspapers, statistical data, personal reminiscences and police records, local histories, maps, and family genealogies — and this list is by no means complete — but in volume two, as in the earlier parts, the footnotes are not just an acknowledgment of the sources used. They are also the means by which a dedicated researcher has sought to make available to his community of readers all the supplementary evidence that he has been able to gather on the Cantonese migrants. The double-column format and the generous font size greatly assist a reader's foray into the footnotes and the publisher's willingness to allow such extensive commentary has transformed the references from a necessary appendage to a richly-documented sub-text. These footnotes are written to be read and to do so is a rewarding experience.

A work of this magnitude could not have been undertaken, let alone completed, without family and community support and these debts are readily acknowledged. This volume affirms the co-operative nature of scholarly endeavour, an approach which advocates of user-pays research practices have clearly never understood. Both author and publisher can take pride in the fact that their combined talents and dedication have produced an enduring outcome.

JEANINE GRAHAM

University of Waikato

Making Men: Rugby and Masculine Identity. Edited by John Nauright and Timothy J.L. Chandler. Frank Cass, London, 1996. 260pp. UK price: £35.00 hb. ISBN 0-7146-4637-7.

The Game of Our Lives: The Story of Rugby and New Zealand and how they've shaped each other. By Finlay Macdonald. Viking, Auckland, 1996. 138pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 0670-869074.

THESE TWO BOOKS present something of a dilemma. While *Making Men* undoubtedly carries the greater academic credentials, its coverage of New Zealand rugby is clearly its weakness. *The Game of our Lives* — the book of the recent television series — hints at a more up-to-date analysis. Yet its journalistic tendency towards generalization, and especially its lack of referencing, place obvious limitations on its academic value.

Making Men sets four tasks in attempting to unravel the white male hegemony of rugby. Firstly, by focusing on the most traditionally 'manly' team sport, it seeks to add to historical analysis of the significance of gender in sport. Secondly, it examines the relationship between rugby and institutions of social power in Britain, Australia, New Zealand and South Africa from the late nineteenth century onwards. Thirdly, it traces the diffusion and different adaptations of rugby in these countries and the diverse meanings that were attached to the game by contrasting cultures. Finally, as a purely descriptive account, *Making Men* aims to fill significant gaps in the existing social history of rugby.

These objectives are met with varying degrees of clarity. The gender analysis,