

stemming from the North American colonies to the antipodes, and applying to the Australian colonies as well as New Zealand, where it was formalized in the Treaty of Waitangi. Reynolds makes out a convincing case for the existence of Aboriginal title in the common law even though the Aborigines did not get a treaty, nor even recognition of their title by the Australian courts. His findings are in line with those of other recent scholars who have worked on aboriginal rights in other territories, including P.G. McHugh for a Cambridge thesis, 'The Rights of the New Zealand Maori at Common Law' (1987). But Reynolds deserves credit for testing the doctrine for Australia. It remains to be seen whether the judges, when they get the opportunity, will take note.

The whole question is taken up and expanded in Reynolds's other book, *The Law of the Land*. The Colonial Office records are examined again for the 'recognition' and 'frustration' of Aboriginal land rights in the 1830s and 1840s. But, like the historians he condemns, Reynolds drops the whole question for 100 years before briefly taking up the recent Aboriginal land rights movement. Nevertheless, *The Law of the Land* should not be dismissed as a tract for the times. Aboriginal rights, having been so vigorously reinstated into Australian history, are unlikely to be cast aside again.

M. P. K. SORRENSON

University of Auckland

Emigration from North East Scotland. Vol. I: Willing Exiles; Vol II: Beyond the Broad Atlantic. By Marjory Harper. Aberdeen University Press, Aberdeen, 1988. 380pp., 317pp. NZ price: \$29.50 each.

MARJORY HARPER has produced a thorough and scholarly study of emigration from one small part of Scotland to many parts of the world. Her two-volume work is of more interest to students of migration than to New Zealand historians, but it does contain relevant and interesting information about migration to this distant and minor destination.

Harper begins by talking about aggregate statistics. Although official figures understate the numbers of Scots who left for New Zealand (mainly because they do not include Scots leaving from London), it is quite clear that it was not an especially popular choice. The great majority of Scots went either to the USA or Canada to join relatives who had moved there earlier and to take advantage of the great opportunities offered, especially to farmers. The shorter sea voyage also held understandable appeal. Many more Scots went to Australia as well, even though a greater percentage of New Zealand migrants were Scots and the colony received more favourable coverage in the Scottish press than did Australia. Our Scots migrants, in other words, represented an important but minor tributary of a major migration (roughly 50,000 out of more than 600,000 who left Scotland in the nineteenth century).

Harper moves from aggregate figures to the ways in which would-be emigrants learnt about the various destinations. Local newspapers and agents seem to have been the most important sources of information, along with letters sent home by departed relatives and neighbours. John McGlashan and James Adam both receive special mention for their efforts in attracting migrants to Otago.

Harper notes that most immigrants to New Zealand had to have a little capital because, even if they were assisted immigrants, they had to pay the boat fare to London. Very few paupers were directed to New Zealand from the Aberdeen area, although ten girls from the Aberdeen industrial school were sent to Dunedin. Initially New Zealand seemed to hold out a special appeal to agricultural emigrants who had been sent crashing down the

agricultural ladder by the traumatic events of the Clearances. Land appeared to be abundant and cheap in New Zealand and the climate and farming styles similar to those of Aberdeenshire. But from the late 1850s the local press started to issue less favourable reports. Letters were published complaining about the large amount of capital required to set up in farming, and doubt was expressed about New Zealand's future economic prospects. Complaints about high costs and low wages also appeared throughout the 1860s. Thereafter, the New Zealand honeymoon was over and the press returned to advocating the advantages of the older North American alternative. This swing of opinion helps to explain the difficulties experienced by agents employed during the Vogel immigration drive.

The remainder of Volume I and most of the second volume concentrate on North America and philanthropic schemes directed towards that part of the world. Women migrants also receive special attention, but little is said about single women migrants to New Zealand. It seems that, despite continual comment on the demand for domestic servants, young women of North Eastern Scotland showed little interest in this part of the world.

Harper's study makes abundantly clear how complex the process of immigration is. 'Push' and 'pull' type explanations are shown to be totally inadequate in explaining the complex conjunction of particular personal circumstances and impersonal economic and social forces that determine decisions to migrate. Unfortunately, this valuable contribution to immigration history takes the argument of individual decision too far and produces few helpful generalizations about the Scottish migration experience. This failure is compounded by an unwillingness to engage in dialogue with the considerable body of theory relating to the migration process. One is left wondering if two volumes were really necessary. Tighter editing and a single volume would probably have forced the author to concentrate more on the ways in which this local study related to the broader questions concerning migration.

TOM BROOKING

University of Otago

Social Welfare 1850-1950. Australia, Argentina and Canada Compared. Edited by D.C.M. Platt. Macmillan, London, 1989. 208pp. NZ price: \$168.00.

THE OUTCOME of a comparative history conference in London, this volume contains ten short articles on charity, health, housing, and labour in 'the three principal regions of recent European settlement: Argentina, Australia and Canada'. New Zealand qualifies as a region of recent European settlement as defined here, and there are indeed 12 references to New Zealand in the index and seven to New Zealand's Liberal reformer, William Pember Reeves. However, New Zealand is generally mentioned only in an Australian context.

In his introduction, the editor slips easily within the same paragraph from discussing Australia to Australasia to New Zealand. Sometimes during a discussion of Australia he draws his examples from New Zealand. One could be excused for coming away with the impression that New Zealand decided to join the Australian Commonwealth in 1900 after all! There are, however, two important chapters for New Zealand historians. Diane Kirkby's chapter on compulsory arbitration in Australia draws out some interesting conclusions on the nature of compulsory arbitration in Australia which would be equally applicable to New Zealand. The discussion in the final chapter by John Fogarty of 'Social