

The History of Policing in New Zealand; Volume I: Policing the Colonial Frontier. By Richard S. Hill, Historical Publications Branch, Department of Internal Affairs, Wellington. 1142 pp. NZ price: \$77.00.

MOST New Zealanders take for granted the omnipresent police. Few know their police and fewer still understand the extent and pressures of policing. For most of them constables are cardboard figures, desirably present but anonymous, and often frightening.

This situation is not new. In New Zealand's history the anonymous police occasionally operated *en masse* — against Irish rioters, resisting Maori, militant trade unionists, Depression rioters, and anti-tour protesters. But they rarely appear in the performance of individual duties and in that history little has hitherto been written on police loyalties, training, hardships, prejudices, command structure, and effectiveness. The first volume of Richard Hill's projected four-volume official history of policing in New Zealand addresses this deficiency. Published in two parts, a necessity dictated by its size (over 1100 pages), Hill's *Policing the Colonial Frontier* is a scholarly, monumental, and definitive work, prepared in the old style where every 'i' must be dotted and every 't' must be crossed. It is wordy, discursive, overwhelming in its attention to detail, but a computer bank of information available to researchers into early New Zealand police and colonial history.

Hill begins with an essay on the formation and development of British policing, with two late eighteenth-century and early nineteenth-century models — the Irish and the Metropolitan police — discussed in some detail. These parallel developments reflect two conflicting philosophies of policing. The para-military Irish formula, designed for coercion, saw the development of armed mounted police. The Metropolitan police evolved as mostly unarmed "bobbies".

From this base Hill proceeds to describe and discuss New Zealand's policing from the pre-treaty years to 1862. The second part of his work considers provincial and official runanga policy from 1853 to 1862, and is the high point of Hill's exploration, with a clear discussion of New Zealand government attempts to adapt imperial formulas to an increasingly racially-tense colonial situation.

Detail and finely tuned research make this first volume a splendid reference work. Political background and police administration are well melded, and it fully meets the sponsor's requirements for a comprehensive official history. It does not meet the needs of the average reader. It is too detailed and in some areas badly organized. Firm editing could easily have reduced its repetitive and unnecessarily expansive verbiage by at least one-third. Professional selection and placement of photographs and maps are vital for a book of this kind. Alas, the maps of New Zealand's political divisions and of settlement placement contribute little to the telling of the tale, and are blocked in a most unimaginative way. The photographs are mainly of officials. The 1849 police stockade at Porirua and the 1850 sketch of a Maori constable are representative of the few that support the text. Maps showing police location would have been useful, also tables including force numbers in particular regions.

There are some gaps. The boredom of police work, its hierarchial nonsenses, and the hardships, dangers, and persistence of several generations of constables, do not shine through. There is little consumer response. The reader is left wondering how the police were perceived by colonists, good and bad, and by Maori resisters and kupapa. On one of the few occasions when the author deserts administrative history

to place muscle and flesh on his characters, he shows considerable flair. His discussion of Joseph Zillwood is masterful: 'Meanwhile the vicious circle common to the lives of many policemen had begun for Zillwood: financial problems had led to depression, depression to drink, drink to financial problems of greater magnitude and his wife left him.' Zillwood is no cardboard figure. Hill tells of a man who tried hard to be a dutiful constable, failed, and committed suicide. There is pathos in the coroner's jury verdict that Zillwood's death was a felony against the Crown.

Richard Hill's Marxism is present in his text, but it is not intrusive. However, his assumption that a proto-social Darwinism permeated colonial and British racial and class attitudes in this period is dubious. All in all, he emerges as a talented researcher who has written one of the most significant works on New Zealand's history in the last decade.

LAURIE BARBER

University of Waikato

The One Best System? A Revisionist History of State Schooling In New Zealand. By Roy Shuker. Dunmore Press, Palmerston North, 1987. 286 pp. NZ price: \$38.95.

CARR'S DICTUM strikes again: the work of the historian really does mirror the society in which s/he works. With education in the thick of national controversy, with disputes rumbling on over reviews of all aspects of educational provision, it should not surprise us that there have emerged challenging and argumentative works addressing the social and political significance of education. These include Openshaw and McKenzie's recent collection, and the present contribution of Roy Shuker. *The One Best System?* seeks to explore the historical construction of state schooling in New Zealand, in particular the role of schools in reproducing social and economic divisions.

Shuker argues that the school system has acted overall to create and maintain hegemony in the interests of dominant groups, but that this process has been a contested one which has been influenced in different ways by the 'cross cutting factors' of gender, race, location, age, and religion. The work concentrates initially upon the 'basic configuration of the state, economy, and class', outlining the pursuit of equality of educational opportunity over the past century, and emphasizing the importance of the period from 1890 to 1930. The role of the state education system in regulating the social activities of youth and children, disseminating ideologies such as patriotism and a commitment to political democracy, preparing young people for the changing needs of the labour market, are then dealt with in detail. The persistence of the academic curriculum and the use of intelligence testing demonstrate, for Shuker, the reproduction of existing structures of inequality that have been obscured by an 'ideology of egalitarianism'. A similar message is conveyed in discussions of Maori education, gender and education, religion and schooling, and rural and urban education. Throughout, Shuker's work is lively and readable. It makes competent use of recent research findings both here and overseas. And it succeeds in developing an integrated critique — the case for the prosecution, as it were — against many aspects of state education that had escaped critical attention until quite recently.

While his book reflects the conflicts of New Zealand in the 1980s, Shuker's 'revi-