

In the decade following 1927 major gains were made, particularly in reducing mortality from puerperal sepsis. In the process, doctors managed to retain control over childbirth while diverting criticism of their care into a campaign for improved obstetric education at the Otago University Medical School. Perhaps more significantly for the future development of maternity services in New Zealand, the Obstetric Society successfully defended its definition of childbirth as an illness requiring professional medical intervention, despite evidence that it was doctors' 'meddlesome midwifery' which had originally heightened the risks of women in childbirth. The whole campaign trained doctors in the attitudes and political responses which served them so well in resisting the introduction of social security a decade later.

While Paget and Jellet are credited with a determination to save lives, and Gordon's hard-headed professional advocacy is mellowed by her compassionate support of caesarian section over pubiotomy (the barbaric practice of sawing through the pelvic bone), Mein Smith sees eugenics as the underlying social policy motivating the major actors in this dispute. The pro-natalist arguments of the eugenicists subordinated the interests of individual women to the overall need to increase and improve the race. Women were to be freed from the fear of childbirth, not so much to make labour less painful or dangerous, but to counter a declining birthrate.

Mein Smith makes the most of the personal dimension of institutional conflict, and in its concentration on policy and policy makers, *Maternity in Dispute* remains methodologically faithful to the existing historiography of welfare in New Zealand. The conflict between the Department and the profession certainly warranted her attention to the detail of medical theory and practice. But there is still another book to be written on the hospitalization of childbirth. If the characters of the men and women who influenced the course of the dispute are well fleshed out, the experiences of the mothers, the midwives, and the nurses remain untold. Mein Smith also uses contemporary statistics effectively, but makes no attempt to rework the large fund of statistical data available. As a result, she fails to discuss the influence of the rapidly declining birth rate, either on the increasing level of institutional deliveries or on the maternal mortality rate.

The late Jim Holt (to whom the book is dedicated) made the decision to publish Mein Smith's excellent MA thesis during the few weeks he held the position of Chief Historian. The need for the best work in New Zealand history to find publishers goes well beyond the requirements of those actively involved in teaching or studying history. Contemporary discussion of social policy and social services in New Zealand needs to be informed by historical perspectives, particularly of the quality of *Maternity in Dispute*.

MICHAEL BELGRAVE

Waitangi Tribunal, Wellington

Churches and People in Australia and New Zealand, 1860-1930. By H. R. Jackson. Allen & Unwin/Port Nicholson Press, Wellington, 1987. ix, 210 pp. NZ price: \$24.95.

THERE IS a growing body of scholarly material relating to New Zealand religious history as Lineham and Grigg's recently up-dated bibliography makes amply clear.

But there are few, if any, comprehensive attempts at comparative study of Australasian religious life, institutions, and influence. This book is, therefore, an important pioneering study. It is not, however, a first attempt at 'a comprehensive history of Protestantism and Catholicism in Australia and New Zealand' (p.1), and the author is at pains to make this clear.

The title, indeed, suggests the author's aim. Hugh Jackson did not set out to write an account of the churches as organizations, or in terms of their main figures or the pronouncements of their principal assemblies; but rather an account of them as 'primarily people' in a variety of situations and relationships, in particular as immigrants adapted to new environments, and with reference to any Catholic/Protestant contrasts. The two opening chapters attempt to sketch what is known of the religion of the immigrants and the 'distinctive nature of their new environment'.

The succeeding five chapters describe and discuss changes in the nature of revivalism over the period 1860-1930; the sense of separation and identity between churches and the larger community; Sunday observance; doctrine; and the family. This last chapter (an especially interesting one) looks at contraception, family worship, and authority within the family. A relatively brief final chapter ranges widely in search of general patterns and concludes that, while the Protestant and Catholic churches have had some success in translating and establishing 'the standards of decency customary in the British Isles' (p.172), they have had little, if any, creative impact either within their own organizations or on society as a whole. More in sorrow than in anger, perhaps, Jackson concludes: 'Protestant and Catholic leaders alike were in the habit of defining Christian faith in narrowly individualistic and moral terms. It was easier for everyone that way' (p.173).

This wide-ranging and compressed account is buttressed by 26 pages of careful notes and a six-page bibliography. The book is pleasantly illustrated and the text complemented by, rather than burdened with, graphs and tables. The sources utilized are predominantly Church of England, Presbyterian, Methodist, and Congregationalist and, in the Australian case, are largely confined to materials related to New South Wales, Victoria, and South Australia. In the case of New Zealand there appears to be a further limitation: periodical sources on Anglicanism are of Auckland origin only. Anglican materials for New Zealand are diocesan in character and at that time there was no national periodical. The researcher thus faces formidable logistic problems, but the omission needs to be noted.

Moreover, Jackson lumps in Anglicans with Protestants generally. This is adequate for many purposes and outraged complaints by some Anglicans on this score often have the character of special pleading. But in a study which focuses on 'churches as people' there might have been a place for some attention to Anglo-Catholicism which, in its heyday, was formative in some parishes that enjoyed considerable success. Marie Peters' excellent account of St Michael's, Christchurch, is important in this connection but was, no doubt, published too late for Jackson to utilize.

These gaps in New Zealand and specifically Anglican evidence suggest a further difficulty. The territory to be surveyed is very large and, as yet, imperfectly mapped. Jackson's book discloses as many gaps as it fills, and thereby usefully suggests further avenues for research by its author and others. At times, however, the account becomes episodic and impressionistic. The conclusion that in Protestantism there was an increasing 'formlessness' in doctrine is based fairly heavily on a case study of Australian Congregationalism alone. Occasionally, in a book quite fertile in hypotheses, a plausible line of explanation is not followed up. There was clearly less

endemic religious doubt among Catholic laity during the period covered. Was this due to an educational experience that involved less 'higher' education and the firmer inculcation of attitudes of respect for authority and tradition? Sometimes Jackson seems not to have made use of sources which are readily available. He remarks that 'our knowledge of the immigrants in any aspect of their lives in their homelands is at present primitive' (p.5). But Rollo Arnold's *The Farthest Promised Land: English Villages, New Zealand Immigrants of the 1870s* (1981) makes some contribution and does not appear to have been utilized. Finally, the termination at c.1930 seems a bit arbitrary (as the author himself recognizes), and, in fact, Jackson incorporates quite a few references to evidence beyond this period.

Clearly, however, some limits had to be drawn, some limitations accepted, for a study of medium length. A book which ranges across two countries and several denominations is a large task and a severe test of the skills of researcher and author. Overall this is a significant and valuable pioneering study in comparative Australasian religious history.

COLIN BROWN

University of Canterbury

Christchurch — St Michael's: A Study in Anglicanism in New Zealand, 1851-1972. By Marie Peters. University of Canterbury Publication No. 36, Christchurch, 1986. xii, 225 pp. NZ price: \$29.95.

ANYONE who came into contact with high church Anglicanism in New Zealand in the 1950s soon heard of St Michael's, Christchurch. At St Michael's, it was reported, the words 'Mass' and 'Father' were used as a matter of course. (They would certainly have caused an outcry at St. Luke's, Mt Albert!) St Michael's had a tabernacle for perpetual reservation of the Blessed Sacrament, though the Bishop of Christchurch had refused to allow it to remain in its 'proper' place on the high altar. Its vicar could be seen at the church door after High Mass wearing the 'correct' priestly garb of cassock, biretta and buckled shoes. Mass was celebrated not from the 1662 Book of Common Prayer but from the English Missal, which was an unauthorized translation of the Roman Mass. The Church had a parish primary school run by a community of Anglican nuns who wore habits indistinguishable from their Roman Catholic counterparts.

That St Michael's was so well known (or notorious) is evidence of the weakness of the Anglo-Catholic movement within New Zealand Anglicanism. In Australia, by the 1920s, Anglo-Catholicism had become well entrenched in a number of dioceses, especially in Queensland and outback New South Wales. In the Anglican Church in New Zealand, by contrast, apart from the dioceses of Dunedin and (under Bishop Cherrington) Waikato, the dominant tradition was low church. The New Zealand church was strongly influenced by its CMS origins and by a number of Protestant-minded clergy who came in the late nineteenth century from Ireland. In this unsympathetic environment Anglo-Catholicism remained a minority subculture — a small network of 'Catholic centres' in the major cities that drew their like-minded congregations from a wide area, but with no national institutions or major organizations to ensure continuity or obtain mass support. By the 1950s there were Anglo-Catholic