

wearing a little thin. A book on democracy and power in New Zealand worthy of the name still remains to be written, and its author will need a more tough-minded approach than this.

For political scientists, the strength of the book is in its fine and distinctive balance of theory, description, and analysis. Mulgan's premise is that 'the rejection of ideology in politics is itself ideological'. Students of political theory will find the book a useful application of this insight to New Zealand politics; and students of the political process will find among other things a broad overview of the making of agricultural policy, which helps to fill a hitherto yawning gap.

For those historians interested in matters theoretical, the book could contain some useful hints. Even staunch empiricists might consider the direction of some attention toward the historical study of the organization of interests in New Zealand. Farmers and unions, it is true, have had some attention. But what of manufacturers, employers, and other business groups? What of the role that the state has played in the organization of interests? Two examples of this remain largely unexplored: the first, the experience of World War II and 'economic stabilization'; and the second, the National Development Council experiment of the late 1960s and early 1970s. Perhaps historians could take up the concept of 'corporatism' as Mulgan has done with respect to agricultural policy and, incidentally, as Pat Walsh has done in a major reinterpretation of the Industrial Conciliation and Arbitration Act. Finally, Mulgan's use of the concept of populism as a recurring theme of leadership in New Zealand, while repeating with more erudition an argument made by Tony Simpson some years ago, deserves the attention of the numerous army of New Zealand political biographers.

JACK VOWLES

University of Auckland

Educating The Workers? A History Of The Workers' Education Association In New Zealand. By Roy Shuker. The Dunmore Press, Palmerston North, 1984. N.Z. price: \$13.95.

IN THE last thirty years, the study of the history of education has been transformed. Formerly the province of educators celebrating the rise of compulsory schooling and the teaching profession, it has become recognized in many countries, including the United States and Britain, as an important aspect of social history. This rehabilitation has not yet been reflected in the New Zealand scene, however. Here, the history of education occupies an academic twilight zone between the territories of education and history. It has tended to be regarded as a decorative adjunct to the academic study of education, which is dominated by empirical psychology and largely abstract philosophical approaches. At the same time, it is treated as distinct from and inferior to 'real' history. Thus the classic paradigm of the history of education in New Zealand, a whiggish preoccupation with charting the progress of free, secular, national and compulsory schooling, has remained almost unchallenged. A. G. Butchers, its leading pre-war exponent, has been succeeded by Ian and Alan Cumming

with no noticeable shift in approach. The isolation of the history of education in New Zealand exemplifies the sociology of academic knowledge; the continued failure of academic educators and historians to respond to overseas appraisals in this field probably reflects New Zealand's geographical isolation and suspicion of change.

This book is a gallant attempt to break out of the traditions confining the history of education in New Zealand. Roy Shuker's earlier work has shown some appreciation of 'revisionist' writing in this area in the United States, especially the marxist species of the genre. He is an active member of the cultural studies group at Massey University, strongly influenced by the Birmingham-based Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies. Offered the chance to write an 'official' history of the Workers' Educational Association in New Zealand, Shuker has chosen to attempt a 'theoretically informed history', concerned with the conflicting ideologies which have been at the heart of the WEA and the social and political pressures which have shaped its development. The WEA is seen as 'a site of struggle, where various factions compete for ideological dominance of the Association' (p.162). Its local groups, Shuker points out, have usually tried to steer clear of party-political controversy, claiming that they were engaged in the 'impartial' study of social and political issues in much the same way as their spiritual parent, the WEA in England. As their clientele has broadened from its original working-class base, 'cultural' subjects like literature, art, music and drama have increased in popularity. But the WEA's 'objective' rhetoric, and especially its growing cultural dimension, have sat uncomfortably with the social and political aims of a 'radical minority'. At the same time, outside groups, especially the government and the University of New Zealand, have tried to make sure that the WEA did not become 'too threatening of the status quo' (p.166). In general, Shuker concludes, the WEA in New Zealand has functioned as 'an agency for middle-class cultural hegemony' more than as 'a force for social change' (p.164).

Shuker cites E. P. Thompson to support his declared notion of history as 'a dialogue between theory and evidence' (p.162). However, in his desire to demonstrate the nature of the WEA as an agency of social control, Shuker sometimes neglects this guideline. For example, he argues that the decision of the National government in 1982 to discontinue its annual grant to the WEA was due to the fear that it might in some way threaten the status quo. This in turn might imply that the WEA in the years immediately before 1982 had been a force for social change rather than an agency for middle-class cultural hegemony. However, Shuker gives no evidence of such a threat, nor of the fears of the Government — indeed, he shows that the rationale of the grant's withdrawal was a preferred emphasis upon formal schooling and a reaction against 'frippery and hobby education'. Here is a fine irony: the WEA's tendency towards respectability and culture became the pretext for the Government's decision of 1982. But Shuker is unable to appreciate this irony, because of the inflexibility of his overall position. Again, when the Minister of Education in the early 1920s, C. J. Parr, comments that the WEA might be able to help provide instruction in the 'three Rs', Shuker is much too eager in his reactions: 'Such a comment ominously echoed 19th-century advocates of popular education as a form of 'social control' of the mass of the population.' (p.59). The academic standards insisted upon by the University of New Zealand tend to be portrayed as an excuse for asserting political control over the direction of the WEA, but again, usually by implication rather than evidence. Indeed, one is often tempted to think that Shuker's 'dialogue between theory and evidence' is a dialogue of the deaf.

Shuker's book is also curiously vulnerable to a criticism of quite a different kind, that its character as an 'official history' has led him to mute his ideological convictions in the interests of celebrating the traditions and successes of the WEA. He evidently feels obliged to spell out the perspectives and concepts which inform his work, and indeed criticizes earlier historians of the WEA in New Zealand for their 'lack of ideological articulation' (p.162). Yet his own 'explicit theorising' is oddly tucked away in an 'afterword', while the book itself is prefaced by a photograph of Shuker signing the publication contract in the distinguished company of WEA leaders. The author also shows a certain ambivalence in his treatment of different phases of the WEA's history. He is most trenchant in the first seven chapters of the book, on the WEA before 1945 — ground which has, incidentally, been well prepared by A. B. Thompson and John Colquhoun. By contrast, only two chapters are devoted to the perhaps less familiar period since the Adult Education Act of 1947, and in these the cosy scene of the book's opening photograph becomes the dominant image. Shuker's ideological concerns here dissolve into glowing descriptions of individual WEA workers and groups, and an orthodox account of the WEA's conflicts with other groups in the field of adult education. In fact, the book in its later stages becomes almost indistinguishable from the traditional type of educational history — celebratory in style and institutional in scope.

Shuker's book, then, may itself be regarded as a 'site for struggle' in which two opposing notions of the history of education are fighting for dominance. It is in general a useful contribution to the field, but the author's radical sentiments sit uneasily alongside the book's official function. Also, Shuker seems sometimes to confuse radical education with good history. The history of education will not be fully rehabilitated in New Zealand until it is recognized by historians as an important aspect of social history and by educators as an important aspect of education itself. Shuker's book is a promising development towards these ends, and deserves to be recognized as such by both types of audience; but there is a long way still to go.

GARY McCULLOCH

University of Auckland

International Labour Migration. Historical Perspectives. Edited by Shula Marks and Peter Richardson. Maurice Temple Smith for Institute of Commonwealth Studies, London, 1984, viii, 280 pp. U.K. price:£22.50.

THIS volume collects together ten of the contributions to a seminar on labour migration in the British Empire and Commonwealth held between 1977 and 1981 at the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, University of London. It is first and foremost an exercise in comparative history, touching on aspects of labour migration in an extraordinarily wide range of countries and historical circumstances. Focussing on the supply side of the international labour market are pieces by David Souden on early modern England, by Adrian Graves on the South West Pacific, by Peter Richardson on Northern China, and by Gill Burke on Cornwall, all dealing with the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. On the demand side, there are studies by Pieter Emmer