

much in accord with public sentiment in the years between the wars. It was, after all, the populist leader of a Labour Government who said, at the outbreak of the Second World War: 'Where [Britain] goes, we go, where she stands we stand'.

When it became known that Ian Milner was writing a life of his father, the question in some minds was whether, out of respect for his father's memory, he might fudge some issues. Now that the book has been published those forebodings have been shown to have been mistaken. It is now obvious that only a member of the family, indeed only Ian Milner, could have done Milner's portrait. Milner kept the public and private sides of his life separate. He was a reserved man, with few close friends. But behind the acclaimed public career a private tragedy was being played out. His wife suffered from mental instability. His daughter, Winsome, was stricken with schizophrenia. Ian Milner shared a great deal of this burden with his father, during years when father and son became separated by deepening ideological opposition. He weaves the two sides of his father's life together with tact, compassion, a clear eye, and a sure touch. His text is counterpointed by photographs of the development of the school buildings, grounds, trees and gardens, some of the great moments in Milner's rectorship, members of the family and others closely associated with him. What strikes a reader who never heard Milner's voice is his compelling eyes. The striking physical presence is clearly in evidence and so, too, are suggestions of reserve and loneliness.

Distinguished lives deserve distinguished biographies. In *Milner of Waitaki* 'the boy' has shown himself equal to 'the Man'.

W. L. RENWICK

Department of Education, Wellington

The Resolution Journal of Johann Reinhold Forster 1772-1775. Edited by Michael E. Hoare. Hakluyt Society, London 1982, 4 volumes. 831 pp. U.K. price: £40.00.

JOHANN REINHOLD FORSTER was a man tormented by spectres and uncertainties. Three 'tedious long years' in southern oceans with Captain Cook nurtured and heightened these fears, making the scientist an awkward and tendentious ship-board companion. Forster and his son George were on the *Resolution* largely for reasons of ambition. They sought to make their way in the English-speaking world by harnessing all possible resources of patronage and pushing themselves forward on all possible occasions. The voyage with Cook was to have established Johann Reinhold's position as a scientist in England and to win him powerful friends, including George III. However, the voyage cut Forster off from such influence and he became plagued by self doubts. Would the voyage produce the rewards he hoped for? Would his former patrons still support him? Would the financial returns be adequate?

Joseph Banks was the occasion for other anxieties. That scientist had treated Forster coolly after the fiasco over the fitting out of the *Resolution*, and the

German was well aware of Banks's capacity to harm his reputation in England. He also feared that the anticipated publication of Banks's own journal and scientific work from the *Endeavour* voyage would pre-empt and overshadow his efforts. Was it for this reason that he gave the name *Banksia* to 'a very minute and prostrated' plant discovered in Queen Charlotte Sound?

In a number of respects this *Journal* modifies J. C. Beaglehole's unsympathetic portrayal of Forster. However, in terms of his suitability for ocean voyaging the original verdict must stand. Forster was physically and temperamentally unsuited to the closely confined conditions of a 462 ton bark. From the outset he was unhappy with his accommodation on board, and the cramped damp conditions in which his scientific work had to be carried on. In his view Cook had gone back on an undertaking to provide a better cabin and throughout the voyage he viewed the commander as obstructive, and barely tolerant of the scientists. Part of Forster's bitterness clearly stemmed from his sense of status and a belief that as a gentleman on board he should be fully taken into the confidence of the commander. The suspicion that Banks had received much better treatment no doubt irked Forster even more, provoking outbursts of venom against commander and crew.

Not surprisingly Forster's gloom deepened with each probe into Antarctic waters. Months in sub-polar latitudes tried all members of the crew both physically and psychologically; even Cook succumbed. However, the cold and damp intensified Forster's inner torments and he was provoked to outbursts about the uselessness of the Antarctic sweeps, the coarseness and hostility of the crew and secrecy of the Commander. When the *Resolution* headed north once more Forster's spirits would lift, giving rise to pronounced and exaggerated bouts of Anglophilia.

To focus too closely on these aspects of Forster would be to detract from the real merits of both the scientist and his *Journal*. He was a detailed observer and an assiduous collector. The ethnographic material in the *Journal* is rich and perceptive, particularly for New Zealand, Tonga and the New Hebrides. In many situations the *Journal* nicely complements that of Cook. In the early stages of the voyage the *Journal* is more informative about the details of life at sea and the practice of seamanship. As the voyage progressed, however, even Forster neglected what became everyday occurrences. It is also more detailed on matters such as the health of the crew and of their commander. Forster exploited every opportunity to botanize and collect specimens of local fauna. Within the world of natural history he was a most zealous killer of birds: indeed in the course of the voyage many hundreds of specimens must have fallen to his gun. One outing in Queen Charlotte Sound produced a bag which would make today's environmentalists wince. It consisted of 30 birds including 12 wood pigeons, 4 South Island kokako, 2 red-crowned parakeets, 4 saddle backs and one New Zealand falcon. On an excursion to Long Island two days earlier the scientist had set fire to the island in the hope that all the dry ferns would be burned off and 'make room for better plants'.

The editing of the *Journal* is both thorough and scholarly. It appears that the Beaglehole volumes have served as the model and the annotation conforms to that high standard, both in terms of its accuracy and level of information. The scientific annotation has been scrupulously carried out, and as a result the *Journal* will be a valuable resource to historians of science and students of taxonomy in particular.

The Introduction to the *Journal* traces Forster's early life from his birth at Dirschau near Danzig to his acceptance of a place on the *Resolution*. It also provides a brief account of the voyage and a textual introduction. Regrettably these are the weakest parts of the work. The biographical section too often becomes a roll call of names and places, as though Forster's importance should be measured by the number of distinguished individuals whom he met, and the places he visited. The exact nature of these connections is not always clear, and the degree of influence specific individuals exerted is not properly assessed.

It is also unfortunate that the sub-editors for the Hakluyt Society have let through passages of awkward and even ungrammatical prose which detract from the material in the Introduction. Subordinate clauses pile one on top of another rendering some sentences incomprehensible. Changes of tense occur within paragraphs and even within sentences, disrupting the flow of the prose. Double negatives and redundancies abound. Words such as 'undecimated' and 'all-embracingness' offend the eye and ear. Sentences occur without verbs. Adverbs and conjunctions combine in irregular unions; 'And, then, now angry, deep in despair, worried about time spent away from the land and therefore precious days wasted away from botany zoology and anthropology, Forster wrote on 21 December 1773 in antarctic waters . . .'. Such lapses should not have persisted into the published work since they detract from what is in other respects a considerable achievement of scholarship.

DAVID MACKAY

Victoria University of Wellington

SPECIAL LIMITED OFFER

The Farthest Promised Land

English Villagers, New Zealand Immigrants of the 1870s

ROLLO ARNOLD

' . . . a break-through in New Zealand historiography.'

Christchurch Press

Published Price: \$35.00

Special Offer Price: \$9.95

Rua and the Maori Millenium

PETER WEBSTER

' . . . a great deal more than was generally known about Rua is now revealed as a result of this fascinating study . . . an important segment of early New Zealand history.'

Auckland Star

Published Price: \$18.00

Special Offer Price: \$9.95

VICTORIA UNIVERSITY PRESS