REVIEWS 89

But with this well-documented work we are deeply in Professor Johnston's debt for an insight into the legal workings of the Victorian 'official mind' and, less certainly, for a change in the connotation of that unscholarly word which we all use.

COLIN NEWBURY

Linacre College, Oxford University

Imperialism and Free Trade: Lancashire and India in the Mid-nineteenth Century.

By Peter Harnetty, University of British Columbia Press and Manchester
University Press, 1972. ix, 137 pp. U.K. price: £3.

Professor HARNETTY has chosen to make a book out of most — but not all of the articles which he has published over the last decade or so. The original articles were undoubtedly meticulously researched, and Professor Harnetty has made them hang together well in book form. But some readers may still find this volume slightly disappointing — and that not only because they have seen most of it before. Professor Harnetty appears here as a disciple of Robinson and Gallagher in their 'Imperialism of Free Trade' phase. Again and again, whether he is discussing the removal of Indian import duties on cotton goods, or government encouragement of the cultivation of raw cotton for export to England. Professor Harnetty returns to his theme: Lancashire saw to it that 'pure' notions of laissez-faire simply did not apply in India, even in the mid-nineteenth century years of the supposed triumph of free trade. But the laissez-faire of many nineteenth-century Englishmen, working in many spheres — notably the laissezfaire of the political economists themselves — was, in fact, remarkably 'impure'. India was not merely an exception to a rule. Furthermore, Professor Harnetty is almost certainly too single-minded in his emphasis on the role of economic interests. One continues to suspect that, even in the case of Lancashire and India, the mid-century 'imperial' story was somewhat more complex; a reading of Sabyasachi Bhattacharyya's Financial Foundations of the British Raj (Simla, 1971) to some extent reinforces this suspicion. One must add that the picture which is beginning to emerge from the work of Morris David Morris, and also from the most recent work of Professor Harnetty himself ('Cotton Exports and Indian Agriculture, 1861-1870', Economic History Review, August 1971 — an article which is neither included nor prefigured in this book), is that, no matter what government policy may have been, Lancashire interests probably had remarkably little practical effect on the Indian economy in the middle and later years of the century. In spite of opposition from Lancashire, the modern Indian cotton industry got under way in that period. The extent of the impact of Lancashire competition on the old Indian handloom industry — or at least on the production of coarse cloth — has probably been exaggerated in the past. And, if Professor Harnetty's latest article is to be believed, in the sixties of the last century, anyway, increased cotton acreage in India did not necessarily mean a diminished acreage under food crops.

It is a pity, then, that this book displays only the work of Professor Harnetty in a rich but somewhat over-cultivated area of what is essentially English history.

90 REVIEWS

He has, however, shown himself elsewhere to be capable of most exciting exploration in the jungle of Indian economic history.

I. J. CATANACH

University of Canterbury

Women with a Cause. By W. B. Sutch. Price Milburn for New Zealand University Press, Wellington, 1973 xii, 248 pp. N.Z. price: casebound \$7.00, paperback \$3.90.

This is a difficult book for an historian to review. The title, Women with a Cause, is an impressive one with a great deal of contemporary significance. However, almost half the book is not about women with a cause but the failure of New Zealand to recognize adequately the need for equal pay and to create the social and economic conditions that would make equality of opportunity possible. The book is clearly directed at New Zealand readers as a general summary of the struggle for female emancipation. It is not a book for the specialist. The historical sections are random, brief and largely dependent on secondary sources. One may well agree with the critical sections but, when they are not long quotes from commissions and reports, they are personal opinions. Nor does the book seem to work as a general introduction to the 'real world' (i.e. in Sutch's terms the world in which women struggle for equality). History and polemic, in this instance, do not blend.

Dr Sutch begins with two short chapters to show that 'femine characteristics' are not universally accepted and immutable but socially determined and that the culture from which New Zealand's European population sprang regarded women as the property of men. He then retraces the history of women — mainly in Britain — from Anglo-Saxon times, through the later Middle Ages, the Tudor and Stuart periods to Mary Wollstonecraft, Caroline Norton, the chartists, Josephine Butler, John Stuart Mill, the socialists and the suffragists. The United States is given a couple of pages, and selected women in Ireland a whole chapter. These historical sections are dissatisfying because they are disconnected, brief and the ideas undeveloped. For instance it is claimed that Mill's writings 'had a shattering effect on those men and women with a higher education' (p. 25), but as almost the only further comment on Mill is that he renounced all rights over the property and freedom of his wife, this contention is left dangling. Likewise the claim that one reason why Eleanor Marx was a feminist was that her father read several languages and his daughters memorized whole pages of Shakespeare and Burns, 'as part of normal family activity', sounds so odd that it needs elucidation. The work here is very largely derivative. (Incidentally, given the well-known unreliability of almost everything Lytton Strachey said must we have him used against poor Queen Victoria on p. 47?).

The sections on women in New Zealand are more useful. Some information on prominent women is collected together and women's organizations are surveyed and assessed in the light of their contribution towards the goal of equality.

The last section of the book is a discussion of two of Dr Sutch's hobby-horses

— New Zealand's half-hearted forays into the field of pre-school education