

Politics of the New Zealand Maori: Protest and Cooperation, 1891-1909.

By John A. Williams. Published for the University of Auckland by the Oxford University Press, Auckland, and by the University of Washington Press, Seattle & London, 1969. N.Z. price: \$7.75; U.S. price: \$8.50.

THIS BOOK adds very considerably to the understanding of Maori history and is a useful addition to the growing historical literature on the Liberal period.

Essentially it is a study of the attempts of a number of Maori individuals and organisations to persuade the Liberal government to accept their policies. These revolved around the central issues of Maori self-government and Maori control of land purchasing; though social reform and the development of Maori farming also became important in the late 1890s and 1900s. Dr Williams's central thesis is that Maoris had two main approaches to trying to safeguard their interests. One was the way of protest symbolised by the King movement and Te Whiti. The protestors saw European society as a threat, they emphasised the conflict between Maori and European institutions and fostered resentment of the limited power Maoris had in the new order. There was also a tendency 'to fall back on their tribal institutions and their mana Maori.' In contrast to this, there was the way of co-operation with Europeans. This stressed the possibility of harmony and urged trust in European promises. The followers of this method were even prepared to accept a limited paternalism as being in Maori interests. The former loyalists belonged to this group.

The book argues that the period from 1891 to 1909 was a formative one for Maori society. First because the majority of Maoris moved away from protest to cooperation as a means of ensuring their political goals and second because the issues, and the policies which were originated to solve them, would dominate Maori political thinking for the next fifty years. In particular the study shows the emergence and growing political importance of the protest movement, the Kotahitanga, which pressed on the government its claims for an independent Maori parliament to control Maori land. Other Maori groups, including even the King movement and members of Te Aute College Students' Association, supported it because of government failure to remedy Maori grievances. Finally in 1900 a compromise was reached between James Carroll the Native Minister and a negotiating committee of Hone Heke (M.P. for Northern Maori), Te Heuheu Tukino and Apirana Ngata. This resulted in two pieces of legislation, the Maori Councils Act and the Maori Lands Administration Act, which gave Maoris limited powers of local self government and some control over the alienation of their lands. Long neglected by New Zealand historians, the importance and positive role of the Kotahitanga is clearly established in this book.

Ngata was able in 1902 to persuade Kotahitanga to disband because it had achieved its aims. That the elders who led it, agreed, was important because it demonstrated a regained confidence in the goodwill of the government. This legislative success, some investigations of specific Maori land grievances, the temporary cessation of land purchase and the appointment of Native Health Officers convinced the majority of Maori leaders that it was now possible to work within the European political framework.

Even after European sentiment forced the government to resume Maori

land purchase in 1905 Maoris were still able to hold and even gain significant concessions. The 1909 Native Land Act, for instance, though it embodied proposals to speed up land alienation, also protected Maori interests. Individuals could no longer sell shares in communal land; only the management committees of incorporated blocks or the assembled owners at a public hui had the right to sell.

The role of the Te Aute College Students' Association (the Young Maori Party) is also reduced to more reasonable proportions. The skills of the young men, Dr Williams notes, were useful to their elders and from 1900 onwards Ngata's role 'was to present Maori opinion to the European public in an effective and acceptable form, while at the same time persuading his own people that not all of their wishes were realistic.' However they were not solely responsible for the gains made by Maoris in this period, rather they supplemented the efforts of the protest movements. Nor were they 'completely iconoclastic toward Maori tradition. They combined a pride in that tradition with a strong desire for westernization.'

The strength of the book is the light it throws on Maori opinion, the protest movements and their relationships with government from 1891 to 1909. However in many ways it suffers from being such a pioneering effort. It is based on a year's work done in New Zealand in the early 1960s for a Ph.D. dissertation and the book is largely a revision of the thesis. This has affected the study in a number of ways.

Probably because of the relative scarcity of published work on the 1870s and 1880s the author obviously felt he had to give the background to his chosen period in some detail. I would estimate that a quarter of the book is devoted to the period prior to 1890. While the analysis is interesting and often perceptive, some of his conclusions now require substantial modification in the light of Dr Alan Ward's work on Maori history from 1860 to 1891. The sections on government policies and the state of Maori society in the 1890s in particular require some amendment. In many respects the 1870s were a high point in government assistance to Maori communities with the Resident Magistrates, the system of Maori assessors and Maori schools all having a major impact on Maori attitudes and society. It was the abandonment of these services and the continual pressure to sell land in the 1880s which produced the political movements of the 1890s.

Though individual sections of the book are well written and thoughtful, its overall organisation leaves something to be desired. Apart from chapter seven which deals with the period from 1898 to 1902 the book is organised on the basis of themes such as 'The Trial of the 1900 Legislation', 'The Removal of Organized Maori Protest', 'The Role of European Justice and Maori Cooperation' (chapters eight to ten). While chronological organisation can become too much of a fetish, it is risky also to depart too widely from it because there is a danger of becoming repetitious and of unduly compartmentalising events, personalities and movements that interacted on each other. There is also a tendency to jump about in time which does not necessarily add to clarity. Unfortunately the book has some of these faults. For instance chapter two — 'The Maori and European Settlement' — gives a potted account of Maori and European contact up till the 1880s, describes the changing laws dealing with Maori land, the policies of the Liberals, settler attitudes and gives a sketch of Maori adaptation and socio-economic conditions in different areas of the North Island in the 1890s.

Chapter three then backtracks to deal with Te Whiti and the King movement from 1870 to 1897.

Though there is some merit in ending the study in 1909, it does give a slightly false perspective. The real achievements of the 1890s and 1900s can best be brought out by a careful summary of the events of the following two decades. What had happened was that the Maoris had produced leaders and movements capable of wringing concessions, substantial concessions, out of parliament. They were not yet in a position to make policy and from 1905 onwards Carroll and the Maori M.P.s were fighting a rear-guard action to preserve these concessions. After 1909 the position tended to deteriorate rapidly. The Native Land Act opened the way to large-scale alienation of Maori land. When the Reform party took office in 1912 they maintained this rate of land purchasing and in the 1913 Native Land Amendment Act removed many of Carroll's safeguards to prevent undue alienation of Maori land. By the 1920s there were just over 4 million acres of Maori land left, much of it leased, much of it unusable.

There remained considerable latent dissatisfaction in Maori society that showed itself in Rua's movement (1906), and the tohunga leadership in the North Island. This was to grow after 1909 under the impact of land selling which was once again to prove highly disruptive to Maori society. R. J. Martin has pointed out in his thesis that Maori farming appears to have declined in the late 1900s. Similarly Maori population growth slowed down after 1906. From 1896 to 1906 Maori population had increased by over 10 per cent each census period; from 1906 to 1911 it only grew by 4.8 per cent. It was not until the 1921 to 1926 period that population grew by over 10 per cent. The arrest of Rua, the conscription of the Waikatos, the high casualties in the influenza epidemic of 1918 further increased Maori discontent opening a way for the prophet Ratana to harness this discontent against Ngata and Pomare.

Indeed it can be argued that Carroll, Hone Heke and Ngata had only won a superficial victory both in politics and in the Maori world. In fact they had managed to persuade the chiefs rather than their followers and though it appeared they had overwhelming support this was due to the nature of the political process and tribal society. While voting was by declaration the chiefs could always put effective pressure on their fellow tribesmen to support their candidate. It was not until Ratana that there was a movement sufficiently powerful to break this. Both Ngata and Carroll and, I suspect, Pomare were essentially tribal leaders.

In such a small society, between forty and fifty thousand people, the impact of personalities was considerable and the book paints a number of lively miniatures. Yet varied as Dr Williams's canvas is, he has not faithfully portrayed everyone. In particular, his portrait of Carroll leaves much to be desired. An important element of the policies of the period was Carroll's rise, first to Member of the Executive Council representing the Native Race (March 1892), then to Native Minister (December 1899) and finally to senior minister in the Ward ministry (June 1909 to March 1912). In this last period he was acting Prime Minister in 1909 and 1911. Part of the reason for his political success was his skill in mediating between Maori and European so that both sides got something they had wanted. Probably from 1900 to 1912 he was the single dominating figure in Maori politics. He was a man who was simultaneously able to give Apirana Ngata his political start in 1905 and persuade the Maori King

to become a member of the Legislative Council and join the Executive Council. Ngata acknowledged that many of his ideas came from Carroll and claimed: 'No Maori dead or living has aspired to the eminence of Carroll. He was the coping stone of a great, if obsolete edifice, resting at the summit of men and women of all the tribes, who differed sharply amongst themselves. Yet united in the demand for a worthwhile place in the future of N.Z.' (Ngata to E. Ramsden, 28 March 1950).

Yet despite a number of other criticisms of this kind that could be levelled, overall the study succeeds very well in describing a complex and crucial period in Maori history. While later research will undoubtedly modify specific conclusions Dr Williams's book will continue to be essential reading for historians and those interested in Maori history.

G. V. BUTTERWORTH

Massey University

The Journal of Jacob Roggeveen. Edited by Andrew Sharp. Clarendon Press, 1970. ix, 193 pp. N.Z. price: \$6.90.

French Explorers in the Pacific. Vol. II: The Nineteenth Century. By John Dunmore. Clarendon Press, 1969. 428 pp. U.K. price: £5.

IN EDITING Roggeveen's journal Mr Andrew Sharp has rendered yet another service to students of the history of the Pacific. Hitherto the only modern edition has been that of Baron F. E. Mulert, in the original Dutch, published in 1911 by the Linschoten Vereeniging, the Dutch equivalent of the Hakluyt Society. Mr Sharp has translated the journal into good readable English and his is likely to become the standard edition, at any rate in English-speaking countries. There is of course a great deal of nautical detail in it (as there is in Tasman's), of little interest except to the specialist. Roggeveen did not call at many islands. His chief claim to fame is as the discoverer of Samoa, but he did not land at any of the Samoan group, for prudential reasons. One of his three ships, *de Africaansche Galeij*, had been wrecked at Takopoto in the Tuamotus and all her supplies, which were in better condition than those of the other two ships, had been lost. There were clashes with the islanders at another of the Tuamotus, Makatea. When Roggeveen at a council that evening mooted the possibility of setting a course for New Zealand, Jan Koster, captain of the main ship *Den Arend*, argued that 'it is absolutely impossible to set our course for Nova Zelandia without exposing everything to the utmost danger'; and this argument prevailed. The only full description in the book, therefore, is of Roggeveen's other important discovery, Easter Island, and this has as a matter of fact already been translated by B. G. Corney for his edition of *The Voyage of Don Felipe Gonzalez* for the Hakluyt Society. The journal does not even cover the complete voyage, since it stops short when Roggeveen reached New Guinea, probably, as Mr Sharp suggests, because 'New Guinea came within the boundaries of the East India Company's monopoly.' This prudential measure did not save Roggeveen, whose voyage had been sponsored by the rival West India Company, from having both his ship and his journal confiscated by the Batavia authorities. Though compensation