

and essentially constructs the work. It is also its main fault. Military histories that omit the stories of the soldiers on the ground, providing a survey of the commanders and strategic decisions, conform to the pattern of past 'official' war histories, not those written in the twenty-first century. The discussion of the mechanics of the battles themselves is confined to an all-too-brief chapter at the beginning of the book, and suffers from a broad-brush description and narrative brevity that assumes the reader is thoroughly familiar with the work of Majdalany, Williams and Caddick-Adams (and others). I disagree with this assumption; the considerable research, analytical and writing skills of the two authors could have provided a more detailed examination of the battles of Monte Cassino involving the common soldier. This brevity means that readers unfamiliar with the earlier works would find this book poses as many questions as it answers. Curiously, this pattern has one departure, in the form of quotations from the diaries and notebooks of some German paratrooper defenders in the final chapter.

The illustrations are an eclectic mix, including recruiting posters and reconstruction pictures dated from after the battle. Many of the pictures – particularly those showing the terrain – need to be bigger, to provide greater clarity to assist the reader in understanding the complexities of the battle and comprehending why it was such a difficult place for the allied armies to take. Omitting the recruiting images to accommodate this would improve the relevance and usefulness of the illustrations.

When I lived in Rotorua, I met several members of the Māori Battalion who fought at Monte Cassino. These veterans, so quick to talk of Minqar Qaim, Munassib and Tebaga Gap, would either fall silent or mutter quietly to each other if the battles at Monte Cassino were mentioned, clearly regarding it as the worst of their ordeals in the war. I regret that if they read this volume, they would find their story barely mentioned.

As an examination of the historiography of the battle strategies and as an analysis of the commanders involved in the campaign, this is a very useful volume; as a history of the campaign, it is incomplete.

LLOYD CARPENTER

*Lincoln University*

*Unpacking the Kists: The Scots in New Zealand.* By Brad Patterson, Tom Brooking and Jim McAloon, with Rebecca Lenihan and Tanja Bueltmann. McGill-Queen's University Press, Montreal and Kingston / Otago University Press, Dunedin, 2013. 412pp. NZ price: \$70.00. ISBN: 9780773541900/9 781877578670.

The outcome of a Royal Society funding grant awarded in 2004, this book has been just under a decade in the making. The product of five authors, it seeks to examine Scottish migration to New Zealand from 1840 to 1936, focusing primarily on issues of origin, settlement and contributions. The chapters range widely to cover demographic overviews of migration and settlement, economic life, contributions

to civil society, engagement with the environment, associational culture, cultural traditions, faith and leisure, and comparisons with the Scottish diaspora elsewhere. The authors claim that New Zealand's significance lies in the fact that Scots provided 20% of the British and European population before World War I, which made them the second strongest ethnic group in the country behind the English. So even though New Zealand was not a key destination for the Scots (the authors make an arithmetical error when claiming New Zealand received 6% of the outflow from Scotland; the figure is actually 3.7%), the Scots were a key component of the country's ethnic make-up.

For those unfamiliar with research on the Scots in New Zealand the book will perhaps enhance their knowledge. It reveals the migrant flow's composition primarily of Lowlanders, the disproportionate involvement of Scots in farming, the Scottish influence in the law, politics and religion, diverse Scottish responses to the environment, the dominance of Caledonian societies, Lowland appropriation of Highland markers of identity, the discarding or modification of Scottish domestic practices, and the significance of destinations other than Waipu and Otago. Family historians will enjoy the use of a database compiled from family history materials alongside other statistical evidence such as that derived from the *Cyclopedia of New Zealand* and material from Scottish associations. Others might enjoy some of the verbal snapshots of renowned (and less notable) individuals, but will presumably lament the absence of images.

Scholarly readers are less well served. They will likely be disappointed in finding little here that is new. Indeed, there is no summary of the primary sources utilized in the book; the 'Select Bibliography' mainly lists secondary sources. This confirms that much of the book's contents have already appeared elsewhere. Indeed, for a book to be so long in gestation and to be a product of several hands, this reviewer is puzzled why more was not achieved. That said, two chapters stand out for what the book might have accomplished had all the authors developed their chapters further: the examination of economic life, and the final chapter which compares New Zealand's Scots with those who migrated elsewhere. It is the comparative approach found here that would have made for an intellectually satisfying volume.

Chapter Four is largely the work of Jim McAloon and primarily uses biographical information extracted from the six volumes of the *Cyclopedia of New Zealand* to compare 2503 Scots with 5105 English-born. While it would also have been instructive to utilize wills, as Lyndon Fraser has undertaken for the Irish, and to longitudinally trace these individuals over their life course, McAloon finds that the Scots were disproportionately involved in farming compared with the English. Their practices, nevertheless, are said not to have diverged much from the English of a similar background, though only a few select cases are given and without dates. McAloon also suggests that Scottish networks were tighter than those of the English but that their clustering was not on a scale similar to the East India Company, Hudsons Bay Company or tobacco colonies. These comparative examples, however, are not instructive, for they generally relate to an earlier eighteenth-century phase of Scottish mobility. The book furthermore claims that chain migration was less common among the Scots to New Zealand than to other destinations as they did not cluster. Yet

chain migration did not necessarily mean that families clustered after arrival. While the chapter is instructive in its comparison with the English, the relative absence of comparisons drawing on the widespread scholarship on Irish migration to and settlement in New Zealand throughout the book is an obvious gap.

The second comparative framework that might have been deployed throughout the book is with the Scottish experience elsewhere in the world, especially as there is now plenty of secondary material relating to the Scottish diaspora to facilitate such an agenda. Again, the final chapter of the book by Tom Brooking shows how this explicit approach would have bolstered the overall volume. We are told that the Scots in New Zealand were more dominated by families than flows elsewhere and that Scottish associations were more distinctive than those of the English and the Irish, but how and why? Indeed, it is puzzling that the stand-alone chapter on Scottish associations did not deploy this comparative approach to delve into how and why Scottish associations differed from those elsewhere in the diaspora and from Irish clubs and societies in New Zealand. Moreover, although we are informed that there were numerous Scottish societies in New Zealand (by 1930 there were 154 associations, 101 of which were Caledonian), how many Scots (and others) were actually involved?

The volume would also have been improved by greater consideration of its specific methodologies. For instance, three case studies seek to examine Scottish settlement in Otago, Canterbury and Wellington, but what was the rationale for the selection of these provinces and why were they not all subject to the same approaches? Otago's story, for instance, is based on historical and genealogical sources; Canterbury's from the *Cyclopedia* data; and Wellington from genealogical records. Moreover, why are certain individuals claimed as Scots in some instances and not others? In Chapter Five we are told that John Turnbull Thomson, of English birth but Scottish descent, is an honorary Scot. But apart from his ancestry, what evidence is there that Turnbull identified as Scottish and why include him in this chapter when elsewhere (Chapter Four) descendants are disregarded? Migrant letters are also occasionally referred to, but problematically. We are informed that Scots paid more attention to the environment than any other topic, but in the concluding chapter we are told that letters from Otago and Southland placed a heavy emphasis on conditions and prospects. How many letters have been consulted and were these from all over New Zealand?

There is a final important error that should be noted for historiographical purposes and a true record. The book's introduction states that the idea for the Scottish project was first canvassed at a 'Celtic Connections' conference held at Wellington in October 2002. In fact, the idea for a project on the Scots in New Zealand took place prior to that event with this reviewer suggesting it to one of the book's authors!

In sum, then, the book will fill some gaps in knowledge for those who know little about Scottish migration to New Zealand. But specialists will be left wanting more and perhaps hoping that the next generation of scholars can deliver the fuller perspectives that the current volume notably lacks.

ANGELA MCCARTHY

*University of Otago*