

A further strength of this novel is the way characters, through acts of remembering, convey the shift in public consciousness that occurred after the war as the true cost became apparent. The chasm that existed between what those who served thought they had been fighting for and the shattered, embittered world they found themselves inhabiting has, in the last decade, attracted the attention of various historians, including Janet Watson, whose work on loss and disillusionment also speaks to key themes articulated in this novel.³

These themes run like scars through the narrative, adding texture and depth to the emotional landscape of fictional characters such as Harry Vickers. Despite suffering shell-shock, Vickers is sent back to Gallipoli to face his demons. Similar military decisions resulted in significant emotional consequences for soldiers whose wellbeing, like that of Vickers, was reprehensibly damaged by the rigors of wartime service.

Grounded in historical narratives, this novel has much to offer. Readers will invariably expand their knowledge of the experiences of Australians who served in Gallipoli and gain further insights into the journey of reconciliation that inextricably binds the families of Anzac and Turkish soldiers. Scates also demonstrates a masterful understanding of on-going commemorative issues that shroud this dark period in our history. For these reasons alone, *On Dangerous Ground* makes a worthy contribution to First World War literary fiction.

MAXINE ALTERIO

Victoria University of Wellington/Otago Polytechnic

NOTES

1 For further information on this topic see Julien Benda, *The Betrayal of the Intellectuals*, trans. Richard Aldington, Boston, 1955.

2 For example, Bruce Scates, *A Place to Remember: A History of the Shrine of Remembrance*, Melbourne, 2009.

3 For additional information on loss and disillusionment see Janet Watson, *Fighting Different Wars: Experience, Memory, and the First World War in Britain*, Cambridge, 2004.

The Visitation: The Earthquakes of 1848 and the Destruction of Wellington. By Rodney Grapes. Victoria University Press, Wellington, 2011. 192pp. NZ price: \$50. ISBN: 978 0 864736 86 4; *All Fall Down: Christchurch's Lost Chimneys*. By Geoff Rice. Canterbury University Press, Christchurch, 2011. 244pp. NZ price: \$29.95. ISBN: 978 1 927145 10 4.

YOU ARE SLEEPING PEACEFULLY when suddenly you are awoken by violent shaking and a deafening roar. People are screaming. You leap to your feet and frantically check bedrooms for children. Now your entire household, and your neighbours, spill onto the street in various states of distress and undress. The shaking under your feet as more aftershocks roll leaves you feeling quite bewildered and helpless. This experience was felt not just by the people of Christchurch when the first of the earthquakes struck on 4 September 2010, but also by the people of Wellington back in 1848. The similarities, despite the time differences, are quite startling.

Earthquakes and the destruction they wreak have played a major role in shaping and reshaping the physical and emotional landscape of New Zealand society. These two books, while both dealing with earthquakes, are quite different in focus. Rodney Grapes has produced an interesting mix of contemporary accounts and science to document the 1848 earthquakes that destroyed much of Wellington, while Geoff Rice has provided an informal account of the diverse chimneys that were lost during the Christchurch earthquakes of 2010 and 2011.

Grapes, whose previous book *Magnitude Eight Plus: New Zealand's Biggest Earthquake* (2000) dealt with the 1855 Wairarapa earthquake, now focuses on the 1848 Marlborough earthquake and its effect on Wellington. He recounts the experience of the settlers who tried to flee Wellington after the earthquakes on the ship *Subraon*, which then ran aground on Barrett Reef. After losing most of their possessions, the disconsolate settlers had no choice but to stay. The majority of the chapters that follow trace through primary records, such as journals, government documents and newspapers, the devastation and social impact of the Wellington earthquakes.

Grapes's selection of contemporary accounts graphically illustrates the sheer terror of the citizens. When the first earthquake struck many did not realise that there would be further earthquakes. John Plimmer, a builder, was on the roof of a house that same morning when he was caught out by the second quake. Besides being very scared he also had a bird's eye view of the devastating effects of the quakes. In particular, he noted lots of fallen brick chimneys as well as seriously damaged houses. Chimneys were a major casualty in this and subsequent earthquakes and figure prominently in all the accounts.

While only three people died in the Wellington earthquakes, it changed the architectural landscape of the city. Many houses, built of bricks or clay, were severely damaged and in most cases these were rebuilt or repaired with wood, which dramatically increased the number of wooden buildings in the city. Up until this point Grapes simply lets the contemporary accounts speak for themselves without any detailed interpretation. There is the odd hint of speculation, mostly about people's responses, but that is all. This is essentially a narrative with excerpts from historical document rather than an analysis of events. While this could be seen as a weakness, it does let the reader experience the raw feelings of contemporaries without any embellishment.

Grapes devotes the latter half of the book to describing how earthquakes were thought to occur in the nineteenth century and the search for their source. Scotsman Alexander McKay, who went on to become one of New Zealand's most renowned geologists, was the government geologist assigned the task of reporting on damage from the 1888 North Canterbury earthquake. According to Grapes, McKay made a startling discovery about the nature of earthquakes during his journey. Up until then earthquakes were seen as having vertical displacement, but McKay noted large-scale horizontal displacement when he investigated both the Hope and Awatere Fault lines. In what is surely a dark chapter in scientific history, this point was deleted in his report. Grapes does not really explain or speculate why the deletion occurred, yet in previous research about McKay and the Awatere Fault, Grapes and John Patterson presumed it was his superior, Sir James Hector, at the New Zealand Geological Survey who edited this aspect from his 1890 report. This is hardly a minor point, given it took until the 1950s for geologists to recognise McKay's findings.

Grapes finishes his account with a first-person fictional piece about what it would be like to experience an earthquake in Wellington in the year 2037. Having lived through the Christchurch earthquakes, I believe Grapes has provided an accurate and vivid account of the emotional and physical aspects of an earthquake.

All Fall Down, by contrast, is a pictorial reminder of what has been lost through the Christchurch earthquakes and their aftershocks. Geoff Rice acknowledges in his preface that he had to delay publication as his 'modest contribution' about chimneys did not seem important in the immediate aftermath of the devastating and fatal Christchurch earthquakes. Normality of a kind has returned and a book about chimneys has proved to be not out of place.

Rice begins with a short history of the chimney with its focus mostly on European and, in particular, English chimneys. These of course provided most of the inspiration for early and then modern chimneys in New Zealand. The rest of the book is divided into chapters about the various domestic, commercial and industrial chimneys around

Christchurch. All the photographs, including some deftly executed observational sketches by Rice, document some great chimneys, especially the domestic ones which ranged from plain brick to the ornate. While they were all functional, some added a dash of style to the homes with art deco or stucco designs. Rice also gives an instance where in a city that is gradually losing all its chimneys some people still want them, but not for their functional purpose. He illustrates this with the case of a couple building a new house. The woman felt that the house looked strange so the builder added a false chimney, much to her satisfaction. Rice suggests there is a primal need to have fires, and the associated chimney is a part of this.

There is a warmth and intimacy to Rice's descriptions, which include a mixture of personal and anecdotal accounts. He recalls stating to his bemused classmates as a boy that he 'loved the smell of tar from the gasworks and the coal smoke from the railways'. Not surprisingly, he did eventually write his book about chimneys. This is an accessible book clearly aimed at the general reader and includes some impressive images, which document the rise and possible demise of the humble chimney. Many of the chimneys photographed no longer exist. Rice has helped record an endangered artefact in Christchurch's architectural landscape.

These books provide different perspectives on the earthquakes and some surprising similarities. Chimneys figure prominently in Grapes's book, as they were often earthquake casualties. Also some of the descriptions of the 1848 earthquake and its aftershocks bear a striking similarity to the Christchurch ones in terms of the human responses. Each author has delivered high-quality and readable accounts of the human and physical results of New Zealand earthquakes.

PATRICK COLEMAN

Lincoln University