

*Piano Forte* is a charming book, offering a glimpse into a world now lost where the piano was the soul of the community. The book is generously illustrated, with the visual material well discussed. However, there are some opportunities that have been missed in this cultural history. While the strength of the book's narrative lies in its dedicated focus on the place of the piano within New Zealand experience, this approach has some limitations. There is little consideration of the role of the piano more widely within British imperial culture — not just in the metropolitan heart, but in other white settler colonies, such as Australia, Canada or South Africa. The teasing out of transnational connections across the British Empire and the United States in relation to the cultural place of the piano, and the imperial networks of commerce, employment, professional training and examination that surrounded its use and function, would have broadened Moffat's study.

Nonetheless, Moffat's achievements in historicising the piano and its soundscapes within colonial New Zealand are to be applauded. The text is a labour of love, written by a sympathetic author who cares about her topic, and adds considerably to our understandings of the aural dimensions of the past.

KATE DARIAN-SMITH

*University of Melbourne*

*Scottish Ethnicity and the Making of New Zealand Society, 1850 to 1930.* By Tanja Bueltmann. Scottish Historical Review Monograph Series, Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, 2011. ix + 246pp. NZ price: \$135.90. ISBN: 9780748641550.

THIS BOOK is a splendid addition to a splendid series on Scottish history. It is the first in that series to feature the Scots abroad. This is a sign of the growing significance of the Scottish diaspora in Scottish historiography, thanks to historians like Tom Devine, John MacKenzie and Marjorie Harper. That the book is about New Zealand could be seen as a sign of the country's recognition as the most Scottish dominion. It is also a tribute to the seminal work of the former Irish-Scottish Studies Programme at Victoria University led by Brad Patterson (one of the supervisors of the thesis out of which this book grew). Some remarkable research on New Zealand Scots has appeared in the last decade or so from Tom Brooking, Rosalind McClean, Rebecca Lenihan, Ali Clarke and others, with more to come, including the multi-authored *Unpacking the Kist: Scots in New Zealand* to be published shortly by McGill-Queen's University Press. Across the ditch, we are well jealous.

As Bueltmann notes in her introduction, 'the dominant fixation on tartanry and highland culture tends to obscure the migrants' lives in the new worlds in which they settled' (p.2). To avoid falling into this same trap, serious historians of the Scottish diaspora have often tended to play down the real significance of 'balmorality' abroad, seeing it as superficial. In a sense it was but it did, after all, stand for something deeper or less obvious. Therefore, there has been a comeback of the study of Scottish 'associational culture' abroad but in a much more probing and analytical way, as with this book. But when the author adds that 'it is the aim of this book to uncover Scottish ethnicity in New Zealand from the verges of nostalgia', we are confused.

An old tradition in the writing on ethnic groups abroad was to focus on celebrating achievements and influence, to say about the new societies, 'we were here, too'. This book is not primarily about the Scots high achievers and the impact of Scottish skills, ideas and characteristics on New Zealand, though these issues arise along the way. The author takes a deeper view, exploring theory concerning ethnic identity, before explaining her approach which places the individual migrant in the middle of widening circles of

belonging, namely ‘family and kinship’, ‘sites of memory’ and ‘ethnic associationalism’ (pp.10–11). She uses this concept to establish why some Scots maintained an ethnic identity while others did not, and how Scottish ethnicity linked with wider social and civic developments.

Bueltmann (mostly) writes clearly and provides detailed maps, graphs and diagrams, which are all helpful in supporting her themes. There are some photographs and a well-chosen cartoon. The strongest sections (in the ‘core chapters’ three to five) deal with ‘ethnic associationalism’, the outer ring of belonging. The analysis is comparative across both islands, drawing on case studies of Caledonian societies at Oamaru and Wairarapa. A perceptive periodization is established, involving the evolution of the terminology of groups, from Caledonian societies formed in the 1860s to the more specialised and more intensely cultural Gaelic societies from the 1880s and Burns clubs from the 1890s, with ‘Scottish societies’ coming after 1900 (p.93). The purposes of the members changed over time, which also highlights the early significance of Scottish-based commercial and political networks, and evolved into an increasing emphasis on recreation and social activities. The issue of admitting non-Scots to Scottish societies was as common in New Zealand as in Australia: where Sydney had Quong Tart, Otago had Sew Hoy (p.96). The specialised cultural groups excepted, I think the significance of the distinction between ‘Caledonian’, ‘Scottish’ and ‘St Andrew’ for the names of these societies can be exaggerated. It seems that fashion may lie behind the name changes, as much as anything. Gaelic societies were necessarily exclusive, unless a lowlander wanted to learn the Garden of Eden tongue, but Burns clubs welcomed anyone who loved Burns — and many foreigners, such as Sir George Grey and ‘Quong Tartan’, obviously did. It is, of course, hard to know about the ethnic identities of those Scots who did not join. A lot more joined the Presbyterian church, which was incidentally a not-inconsiderable vehicle for Scottish identity in the diaspora.

Caledonian games evolved also from purely Scottish affairs, to accommodate not only Sassenachs but also their sports. The distinctively Antipodean connection noted here between New Year commemorations and sporting events is related to the climate (p.127). In the 1890s, cycling became a feature of Caledonian games not only in Oamaru but also in Kalgoorlie. Thus Bueltmann rightly concludes that the games did not represent a simple transfer of Scottish recreation, nor an uncomplicated display of Scottish ethnic identity, but were more a colonial construct. Music and poetry could also be used to show the interplay of heritage and adaptation.

Chapter six on Burns takes us into the second ring. The antipodes featured strongly in the Burns and the Diaspora conference in Edinburgh in 2009. The four New Zealand statues of Robert Burns are obvious physical ‘sites of memory’. Former Premiers were involved in the unveiling of three of them — only one a Scot. The inner ring is illuminated by chapter two on letter writing. Letters are being increasingly used in diaspora studies, by Angela McCarthy and others, but very carefully because of the vagaries of preservation and the unrepresentativeness of correspondents.

International comparisons are made, particularly between the North American and Antipodean diasporas. The author confirms that, as in Australia, Scottish societies in New Zealand were less philanthropic than their counterparts in North America. Bueltmann suggests that the late settlement of New Zealand, the timing of migrant flows, and the gravitation of the more upwardly mobile to the Antipodes help to explain this. But, again, in both Australia and New Zealand, philanthropy was not absent from the Scottish *community* even if the *associations* were progressively less philanthropic in activity. Benefactions might go to church and civic causes rather than to poor individual immigrants. This ties in with her point, noted earlier, about members’ use of associations for networking but that the purposes of members changed. Despite some controversy over the definition of ‘diaspora’, Bueltmann builds on work by Robin Cohen, Donald Akenson

and others in their reconceptualising the term as (unsurprisingly in this postmodern era) 'diasporas' (pp.181–83).

What does all this do for New Zealand history, as opposed to that of Scotland and its diaspora(s)? Well, quite a lot actually, but not as much as the title claims. (*Scottish Ethnicity in New Zealand Society* may have been more appropriate and more consistent with most of the statements of purpose in the introduction.) It incidentally lines up with other research on connections and similarities with Australian history and shows, via the Scots, that the Antipodean dominions have more in common with each other than with our Canadian and American cousins. These sorts of studies of the interplay of migrants' adaptation and continuity, integration and distinction, are a great way to transcend the tired old genre of national ethnic biography, and align with currently fashionable 'transnational history'. It also illuminates regional variations within nation-states.

This study ends just after the Great War and all that entailed about national identity in the dominions and the choices of destination by increasingly working-class Scots emigrants. Bueltmann's conclusions about the relative classlessness, inclusivity and fluidity of Scottish associations after the influence of war are intriguing (p.209). Scottish associations boomed in industrialising Australia in the 1920s, with many of their new members coming from the upwardly mobile working class. She is also able to make links with contemporary developments such as the reawakened interest of Scots at home in the diaspora, both historiographical and political. Unfortunately for the SNP, the associational Scots abroad are, by and large, into nostalgia, not politics. Tanja Bueltmann is now at Northumbria University, where she continues her impressive work on the Scottish diaspora(s), blogging as she goes.

MALCOLM PRENTIS

*Australian Catholic University, Sydney*

*Scottishness and Irishness in New Zealand since 1840.* By Angela McCarthy. Manchester University Press, Manchester and New York, 2011. xvi + 235pp. NZ price: \$183.00. ISBN: 978 0 7190 7761 6.

NEW ZEALAND has always been an attractive destination for Scots and Irish migrants. In the third quarter of the nineteenth century between 11% and 18% of New Zealanders and over one in five people residing in but born outside New Zealand were Scottish. Their ratio in the population declined in the twentieth century but the numbers of Scots stayed substantial. Irish came in smaller numbers, with a peak in numbers around the end of the nineteenth century. The Irish were also a substantial presence in the ranks of the foreign-born, at least until after World War II, when numbers dropped precipitously.

Yet despite their ubiquity these were unusual migrants. They moved to a country where the great majority of them already knew the dominant language and where the customs and behaviours were not all that dissimilar from the customs they had left behind. Scots, especially, moved into societies which they themselves had done a lot to shape and in which they faced only trivial discrimination. The Irish were a little different, as their British identity was less obvious and more contested and as the religious orientation of a substantial minority was Roman Catholic, a religion that attracted prejudice and discrimination. Moreover, Scots throughout the period of this study and the Irish until 1922 were a subsection of a larger and very privileged whole — the British.

Scots and Irish may not have thought of themselves as especially British. In this richly detailed, ambitious and thought-provoking book, Angela McCarthy argues that Britishness was not a particularly accepted concept among Scots and the Irish except in very exceptional and clearly defined circumstances. But they were British and thus were