

Daws also gets dealt to by the up and coming Hawaiian historian Jonathan Osorio. Osorio virtually labels Daws's best-selling general history, *Shoal of Time*, as an insult to Hawaiians. On the other hand, Osorio pays tribute to Daws's predecessor, Ralph Kuykendall. This is despite the fact that he describes Kuykendall as a 'Court Historian' for the haole merchants and planters! Perhaps professional rivalry may explain some of this seemingly short-sighted commentary.

The context for each contribution keeps shifting. While the editors cannot be held responsible for some wayward contributors, I think the lack of consistency detracts from what is otherwise a very engaging anthology. The editors asked each contributor to examine texts 'in the context of . . . their inception, production, and intellectual influence . . . [to] explain why it was important or influential . . . [why the text had] either faded away or lived on?' Unfortunately, too many contributors neglect the long-term impact of the text under consideration.

There is also what I believe to be a note of undue pessimism in the tone of some of the contributions from the ANU school. The best example of this is probably Doug Munro's lament that Jim Davidson's *Samoa mo Samoa* 'has never been integrated into the wider historiography of decolonization'. This may not be the best way of measuring the influence of the book. The session on its impact at the 1996 New Zealand Historical Association conference in Wellington attracted almost 50 members of the local Samoan community. When the late Professor Colin Aikman criticized Jim's ardent advocacy of Samoan self-determination, the audience response was predictably partisan. How dare you: that's *our* history, they said! Vincent O'Malley's contribution on Keith Sinclair's and Alan Ward's pioneering works on nineteenth-century New Zealand brings this larger audience into play. He credits both authors with providing a stimulus for the Maori cultural revival of the past 35 or so years and for helping with an increasing bicultural awareness among many younger New Zealanders.

For all its inconsistencies, this book is nonetheless well worth reading. Pacific history (including New Zealand's part of it) is still alive and kicking.

BARRY RIGBY

Waitangi Tribunal

Sea Devil: Count von Luckner in New Zealand and the Pacific. By James Bade. Steele Roberts, Wellington, 2006. 176 pp. NZ price: \$49.99. ISBN 1-877338-61-3.

THE ANGLO-BOER WAR OF 1899–1902 has been called the last of the gentlemen's wars because each side shared a code of conduct and fought a 'clean' war, if there is such a thing. Count Felix von Luckner (1881–1966) was a hangover from this recently departed age of chivalry. Somewhat fittingly, if quaintly, his vessel, the German sea raider *Seeadler*, was the last square rigger to be commissioned as a warship. During 1917 von Luckner went about the deadly business of sinking almost 26,000 tons of Allied merchant shipping in the Atlantic and Pacific. He did so in the most gentlemanly manner, resulting in the loss of only one life. His prisoners, moreover, attested to his humane and considerate treatment of them. In this way and more 'the Count' has entered New Zealand folklore. Captured in Fiji, he escaped from Motuihe Island in the Hauraki Gulf and led the New Zealand authorities on a merry chase before being recaptured in the Kermadec Islands. Re-incarcerated on Somes Island in Wellington Harbour, his complaints of mistreatment of German internees led to a commission of inquiry that greatly embarrassed the New Zealand military. At the conclusion of hostilities von Luckner was released but New Zealand had not seen the last of him. In 1937–38 he returned to his old haunts on a 'goodwill tour', strenuously denying that he was a Nazi emissary.

His reputation endures as the humane and swashbuckling adversary who captured the popular imagination. Never one to resist embellishing a story and being economical with the truth, the Count contributed to the myths and legends that surround his name with a misleading ghost-written autobiography and a six-year stint on the North American lecture circuit. Much remained unresolved and the availability of new archival material in Germany and New Zealand prompted James Bade 'to re-examine von Luckner's place in the history of New Zealand and the South Pacific'.

There is no question that *Sea Devil* is a carefully researched book and a glance at the bibliography reveals the extent of Bade's archival wanderings (although one omission is the records of New Zealand's Department of Island Territories). The emphasis on factual accuracy and the frequent testing of new evidence against previous assertion sometimes places demands on the reader's concentration. A chronology would have been of assistance to readers. That said there is a strong narrative line, helped by the extent of the illustrations and their informative and prominently displayed captions. Steele Roberts live up to their reputation for attractively designed publications.

Von Luckner emerges from this revisionist text with some of his reputation intact. Bade confirms his humane treatment of prisoners but calls to question the Count's conduct when he himself became a prisoner. Interned at Motuihe Island under relaxed conditions of surveillance and discipline, von Luckner betrayed 'a situation of mutual trust and respect' between the commandant (Lieutenant Colonel C.H. Turner) and the internees. He did so in the full knowledge that this would ruin Turner's career, as it did. While there had been no explicit promise on von Luckner's part not to escape, Bade is quite clear that an understanding was firmly in place, and by breaching this gentleman's agreement von Luckner had dishonoured his own standards of conduct. It is worth pondering the implications. During the Second World War the Austrian naturalist Konrad Lorenz was a POW in Russia. With time on his hands he covertly wrote a manuscript on subjects philosophical and epistemological (in much the same way Pieter Geyl stitched together a draft of *Napoleon: for or against?* whilst a POW of the Germans). Just before his release, the Russian commandant asked Lorenz, on his word of honour, that 'your manuscript contains nothing more than your scientific book?' Reassured, the commandant allowed Lorenz to take his manuscript and ordered that he not be searched on his way back to Austria.¹ One can imagine a different outcome had the commandant known of von Luckner's duplicity.

This 'gentleman of the high seas', then, was less than a gentleman ashore. The *bonhomie* transformed into bluster and big-noting, the altruism into self-centeredness and a craving for the limelight. To an extent he was within his rights, especially in drawing attention to the treatment of internees at Somes Island, even if he did exaggerate. He was a thorn in the side but the fall-out probably had the long-term effect of ensuring better treatment for internees at Somes during the Second World War.

When von Luckner returned to New Zealand in 1938 on his 'goodwill mission' he quickly attracted attention. The Victoria University student newspaper depicted him as a harmless and somewhat pathetic 'comic opera Count'.² The authorities in Australia and New Zealand, more realistically, recognized that he was on a Nazi propaganda mission but were not quite able to pin down the proof. In Germany, however, he was deemed not to have taken his propaganda duties seriously enough and was effectively banned from public life. Again, Bade meticulously assesses the sometimes conflicting evidence.

Sadly, von Luckner's papers were removed from his dwelling in Halle (in the former East Germany) some years after his death and left to moulder on the street. Had these records survived, Bade might have picked up that von Luckner and Dr Erich Schultz (the former Governor of German Samoa) proposed to visit Western Samoa in 1927. The visit never eventuated but the New Zealand authorities were clearly worried that any such occurrence might intensify Samoan agitation against New Zealand rule.³ But overall *Sea Devil* is deeply researched and Bade has performed sterling service in presenting a credible

portrait of this not altogether admirable man. The ghost of Felix von Luckner may squirm at some of the silences and evasions in his autobiography being revealed. Conversely, people would have nothing to fear from biography if they led more honorable lives.

DOUG MUNRO

Victoria University of Wellington

NOTES

- 1 Alec Nisbet, *Konrad Loenz* (New York and London, 1976), pp.98–99.
- 2 *Salient*, 30 March 1938.
- 3 See ACHK 16603 G48 33 S/3(1), Archives New Zealand, Wellington.

Logan Campbell's Auckland: Tales from the Early Years. By R.C.J. Stone. Auckland University Press, Auckland, 2007. 245 pp. NZ price: \$45.00. ISBN 978-1-86940-393-5.

R.C.J. STONE'S DEFINITIVE *FROM TAMAKI-MAKAU-RAU TO AUCKLAND* (AUP, 2001) originally started from an intention to produce a history of post-1840 Auckland. In the past, few had dared to take on such a monumental task. John Barr, then Auckland City Librarian, wrote *The City of Auckland, New Zealand, 1840–1920* (Whitcombe & Tombs, 1922) and, more recently, Graeme Bush published *Decently and in Order; the Centennial History of the Auckland City Council* (Auckland City Council, 1971), while John Horsman wrote *The Coming of the Pakeha to Auckland Province* (Hicks Smith, 1971).

Stone soon realized he needed to research and contextualize the pre-1840 period before he could even start to survey Auckland's Pakeha history. We are all in his debt for that decision, but is his latest book the history that he had intended to write earlier? Certainly given the eight previous books Stone has written on Auckland people, schools, businesses and so forth, this latest does not really break new ground. But Stone has definitely ensured that his chosen topics in this book have now been even more comprehensively explored. Whether Auckland in the nineteenth century will ever be written to his or anyone's satisfaction is another matter. A definitive work is perhaps impossible.

Stone concluded *From Tamaki-makau-rau to Auckland* with discussions of the first land sales to Pakeha in Auckland in April 1841, the abortive Cornwallis settlement, sales of Tamaki land to Pakeha up to 1845 and the mutually beneficial economic relationship between Maori and Pakeha during the 1850s. The link to his current title is as the biographer of John Logan Campbell, the linchpin of nineteenth-century Pakeha Auckland.

Logan Campbell's Auckland is described as a collection of vignettes or portraits of Auckland to 1912, when Campbell died. It is certainly about much more than just Campbell. Topics include a summary of Campbell's contribution to Auckland, how Ngati Whatua became the Tangata Whenua of Auckland, the trees on One Tree Hill, dueling, Falwasser's intriguing 'mangle' press and other newspapers, the sad fate of Dudley Sinclair, the voyage of the *Jane Gifford*, the Auckland that greeted the early settlers, the Parkhurst Boys, the army and naval influence on Auckland society, the *Orpheus* disaster, James Dilworth and education, Anthony Trollope's visit to Auckland, the foundation of Auckland's first School of Art, rugby and Eden Park and Auckland versus Wellington rugby rivalry. Quite an impressive list. There are overlaps between some of the chapters, but they help to elucidate those topics and are not redundant.

Themes not covered include the reaction of local Maori to the 1860s Pakeha invasion of the Waikato. Maori settlements particularly on the North Shore and in Mangere emptied out almost overnight when a night curfew on waka and demands to hand in guns were promulgated in 1863. Orakei Maori on the other hand stayed put. There are also the