

and the 1988 State Sector Act, course enrolments dropped. It had to cope subsequently with changing approaches to management training, and competition from many more management development providers (before 1987 it was virtually alone in the field). As the final chapters recount, it never fully surmounted these challenges.

A commissioned history operates under a number of constraints. It has to pay close account to individuals and to personnel changes that will be of only limited interest to readers with no direct experience of the organization. Conversely — or perhaps perversely — it cannot always be as explicit as an outside reader would like about the reasons for some personnel changes. Nor does it have a brief to place the story in a wider, more analytic context. But it can suggest some directions for such and three are canvassed here.

First is the professionalization of management in New Zealand. The origins of this can be traced back to the drive for 'reform' and 'efficiency' in both the public and private sectors before World War I. There is a hiatus between that wave of enthusiasm and the 1930s and 1940s impulses which Beaglehole charts. Second is the collaboration between the private and public sector in the establishment of the College. The enthusiasm on the private sector side came from Wellington-based individuals, in particular Ron Greenwood, the Wellington managing director of National Carbon. It was in those mid-century years that Wellington came closest to being the financial and industrial as well as political capital of New Zealand, and it is difficult to envisage such collaboration occurring later when commercial hegemony had shifted to Auckland — indeed, that shift was a challenge which the college grappled with unsuccessfully in the 1990s. Thirdly, for the post-1987 period one question must be how does an established and successful 'élite' organization cope with radical change in its environment? This question is redolent with irony because part of the college's mandate was to address precisely such issues.

It can be inferred from Beaglehole's narrative that years of 'success' can make it harder not easier for an organization to change. But for the College there was a more complex story within a story. Having surmounted the 'shocks' of 1987–1990, it made an operational surplus in 1991, a very difficult year for the New Zealand economy. But did this make it less prepared to confront longer-term threats? The question of partnerships offered and foregone — with Henley (pp.155–6), with Mount Eliza in Australia (pp.176–7), and with Victoria University of Wellington (pp.228–9) — is suggestive. Beaglehole's account of the reasons for the decisions against seem plausible in all cases but one is left with a nagging feeling that the College had just enough of an asset base to resist taking such a radical step, thereby at least surviving. These wider-ranging questions could not practicably be addressed within the constraints of a commissioned corporate history, even such a skilled one as this. But it is one of its many merits that it has provoked them.

MALCOLM MCKINNON

Ministry for Culture and Heritage

Those Who Can Teach: A History of Secondary Education in New Zealand from the Union Perspective. By David Grant. Steele Roberts, Wellington, 2003. 390 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877338-21-4.

THIS IS A HISTORY of the first 50 years of the New Zealand Post-Primary Teachers' Association (PPTA). The only comparable study of a New Zealand teacher union is E.J. Simmond's centennial history of the NZEI, published in 1983. David Grant's book, which draws on a wider range of sources, is better in almost every respect.

Naturally, PPTA campaigns for better pay and working conditions loom large. Chapter two, entitled 'Salaries and staffing — the never ending story', deals with the association's

efforts in this regard in the 1950s; three other chapters ('The never ending story', parts 2–4) deal with negotiations up to the present; and other chapters could well have been entitled 'The never ending story: parts 5–N'.

In accordance with the promise of the sub-title, however, there are chapters on a range of other matters with which schools, their controlling bodies, and teachers' unions have had to grapple since the 1950s: the integration of private schools into the state system; student discipline and the debate over corporal punishment; gender equity and the education of Maori; changes in the curriculum and to examinations and assessment; and the great upheaval in the late 1980s after the Picot Report.

As well as providing the union's perspective on these matters, this book also gives the general reader a useful perspective on the PPTA itself, on its mode of operation and on tensions within it over the years. There is a remarkably frank chapter on Martin Cooney's two terms — one full and one cut short — as president and on the reasons for his early departure; and Grant also deals with occasions when the leadership has been offside with more militant or more conservative members and branches. Another chapter discusses the PPTA's relationship with its primary counterpart, the NZEI. Natural allies but with different agendas, the two associations have marched together on some occasions and engaged in wary, tactical manoeuvring at other times.

Perhaps the least satisfactory chapter is the first. The PPTA was created in the 1950s to replace two separate associations: one representing teachers in academic secondary schools and the other representing teachers in technical high schools. The first chapter provides only a very brief sketch of the development of secondary education up to the 1950s and of teachers' associations during that period and it contains a number of errors. The Education Act 1877 was not introduced by George Bowen (p.13); George Hogben was not president of the NZEI and rector of the Timaru High School at the same time (p.14); there were intermediate schools before 1940 (p.15); and there was no 'Education Act 1920' (p.14).

These are not the only such lapses. The chapter on the integration of private schools begins by asserting that New Zealand established a state school system that was egalitarian and 'avoided the tensions in selective, fee-paying or sectarian based systems' (p.63). This is an astounding claim, given that secondary education was not free until the early twentieth century and that there was an entrance examination until 1936. It is followed by the equally erroneous statement that private schools were, until the 1960s, 'exclusively the preserve of the Roman Catholic, Anglican and Presbyterian Churches'. In the chapter on corporal punishment, we learn that education board bylaws stated that 'only in exceptional cases should girls be strapped and in no case should they receive corporal punishment' (p.123). This absurdity, presumably, arises from a hasty reading of the relevant clause or a garbled second-hand account of it. The final chapter begins with an assessment of the PPTA's current situation and argues that recent upheavals have led to a new, potentially more productive relationship with the powers that be; and it might well have ended on that note but it goes on to describe the recent growth in enrolments by foreign students, an odd if not inconsequential ending to such a substantial book.

The book is at its best when it draws on PPTA archives to trace the PPTA's dealings with successive governments and less satisfactory when it relies on PPTA newsletters or other secondary sources on other matters, particularly legislation. In a number of places legal requirements are cited without a specific reference to the original statute or regulations, and some of these claims are astray. It is, for example, claimed (p.69) that integrated schools are 'subject to the 1964 law' on religious instruction in state schools when the Integration Act 1975 makes it clear that they are not. Notwithstanding such limitations, this book is a useful addition to the literature on our recent educational history. A similarly comprehensive and open history of the NZEI would be most welcome.

The book is enlivened by a selection of cartoons by, amongst others, Gordon Minhinnick, Sid Scales, Bob Brockie, Tom Scott and Garrick Tremain. They provide a convenient catalogue of public perceptions of the association over the years and of a succession of Ministers of Education. There are also numerous portraits of PPTA officers and employees, photographs of teachers deliberating and demonstrating and short biographies of selected presidents, general secretaries and notable members of the association. Secondary school teachers are, as this book makes clear, very busy people, and their workload has increased since the system was reshaped in the 1980s and 1990s to make it more efficient. Those who can find time to read their regimental history and its account of the association's tactical victories, stalemates and armistices, will find that time well spent.

COLIN McGEORGE

University of Canterbury

A Strange Outcome: The Remarkable Survival Story of a Polish Child. By John Roy-Wojciechowski and Allan Parker. Penguin, Auckland, 2004. 288 pp. NZ price: \$35.00. ISBN 0-143019-04-X.

A STRANGE OUTCOME narrates the journeys of John Roy-Wojciechowski (hereafter Jan), a survivor with members of his family of Soviet ethnic cleansing and the forced deportation of almost two million Poles during World War II to labour camps in Siberia. Co-authored with journalist and writer Allan Parker, the book provides generous historical narrative in which to place Jan's journeys in national and comparative context. These journeys cover his infant life in Poland, to becoming a victim of Stalin's campaign of terror against Poles, and subsequent internment with his mother and siblings in a Siberian labour camp. From there, Polish relief agencies secured the release of orphaned children and assisted in their transfer to camps in Central Asia and Persia, en route to Jan's final destination, the Pahiatua camp in New Zealand in November 1944. Jan's life is dramatically evocative of the terror and displacement in twentieth-century Eastern European history; his story provides a vivid entry into conflicted memories of forced displacement, migration and assimilation. The narrative of *A Strange Outcome*, like the memories on which it is based, moves the reader across borders, experiences and languages of forced travel, localizing the effects of trans-national and cross-cultural migration history.

A Strange Outcome follows a fairly standard chronological structure. Parker outlines the historical background of Poland's struggle for national autonomy, its interwar history and ethnic complexity. He sets up the context and chronologies of persecution and forced migration that underscore the setting of Jan's stories and memories. Born in 1933, Jan's memories only became truly vivid and impressionable when he was living in a children's orphanage in Isfahan, Persia. Before that time, the narrative reads as the biography of an ordinary Polish farming family in an experiment of the colonization of Poland's western borderlands with White Russians. The Soviet invasion of Poland on 17 September 1939, two weeks after the Nazis, put an end to the fragile farming scheme and brought millions of Poles and their territory into Soviet influence. From this point, the narrative reads as the despair of a fragmenting family: a father who was arrested by the Soviets and executed and the family who are forced at gunpoint and with typically minimal preparation for deportation to Siberia for work in Stalin's forced labour system called the *Gulag*. While some of the brutal history of forced migration of this period is known to historians, what resonates is the representation of the 'forgotten Holocaust', a view I would endorse particularly in the method of deportation of Poles to Siberia,