

judices', 'culture shock' (p.11), or on another level, 'farming on a lower scale' (p.80)—but what do these terms mean? While one does not want to get involved in the internal politicking of the Indian Associations, it becomes apparent to the reader that rather unnecessary attention is paid to certain individuals.

Grammatical, conceptual errors and personal biases aside, there are still too many documentation errors in the citing of sources in Dr Tiwari's paper in the book. The most serious mistakes were quotations without footnotes (e.g. pp.18, 33, 57), and incorrect sources for quotations (e.g. references on p.16 to *Auckland Star* on 15 April 1922, 19 to 20 July 1922, 13 August 1943 are incorrect). Dr Tiwari also did not do his homework when he cited a figure of 671 Indians being in New Zealand from 1909 to 1920 (p.32), because a quick check will reveal that this figure refers to the number of Indians recorded on the census night in New Zealand in 1921.

Most of this poor historical writing is contained in the editor's own paper, a pity one feels, because much of the data was gathered by Indians who were anxious to have their material written up by an authoritative academic. As I have mentioned, the rest of the book for the major part, contains background on aspects of Indian religions, but the relevance of this to the New Zealand context is not clear. Contributions by McLeod, Shephard, Palakshappa and Kasanji do, however, provide interesting and important summaries of Indian communities in New Zealand—and if the reader is very patient he may find that the major historical survey by Dr Tiwari enlarges his view of the history of some of the Indians in New Zealand.

JACQUELINE LECKIE

University of the South Pacific

Maori Dunedin. By Maarire Goodall and George Griffiths. Otago Heritage Books, Dunedin, 1980. 56pp. N.Z. price: \$5.85.

THIS SLIM volume was originally published to coincide with the opening of the new Arai-te-Uru Marae in the Kaikorai Valley, Dunedin. It is extremely compressed in its geographical coverage in that it is confined to urban Dunedin and its historical dimension from a Maori perspective. The compression does a severe disservice to Otago's Maori history which is essentially coastal and regional in its geographic span. Maori history only makes sense when it is related to its own boundaries. It is in grave danger of becoming a quaint colouring-in of the Pakeha landscape when it is deprived of its own, basically tribal, framework. Despite this intrinsic constraint there is much that is valuable even if only for the reason that it is not readily available in print elsewhere. The material on Maori place names in the Dunedin area is, in itself, sufficient justification for publication. Goodall's interest in the Taranaki-Otakou relationship deriving from the exile of Te Whiti and his followers in the South Island in the late nineteenth century protrudes somewhat. It does not do so unduly, however, and points up the need to see important Maori-Maori relationships in New Zealand history. The preoccupation with Maori-Pakeha relationships too often precludes this. The hospitality of the Otago Ngai Tahu to the Taranaki exiles laid the basis of an enduring set of

connections which is still reflected within Maori politics today.

A chapter on the Araiteuru canoe and its origins offers a further contribution to the discussion of an important element in Waipounamu myth and tradition but it is by no means definitive. Only one version of the tradition is given and that is not very fairly sourced. A similar criticism can be made of statements on the Uruao canoe tradition. In a tribal region as widespread as that of Ngai Tahu one must expect variation in tradition, a range of emphasis, and difference as to detail. Whilst a comprehensive treatment of Te Waipounamu myth and tradition is clearly beyond the scope of this volume a cheerful recognition of the range and diversity within the traditions may reasonably be expected. Indeed, if the material is to be used in schools—a hope the authors express—a much more rigorous approach than is evident here is essential. The Maori curriculum has suffered enough from exclusive interpretation.

Two chapters focus on the Otago Maori Land Sales of 1844 and the subsequent political struggles in the Provincial and Parliamentary arenas. That the questions remain—to the Maori at least—unresolved and the subject of Parliamentary attention in the 1980s seems not to have impressed itself upon the author of this section.

The whole perspective on the Otago Land question is unremittingly provincial and settler oriented. Whilst it is useful in factual and chronological terms there is a pattern of interpretation which is scarcely compatible with the concept implied in the title—*Maori Dunedin*.

One of Ngai Tahu's heroes in *Te Ao Pakeha*, Walter Mantell, has his lifelong commitment to racial justice dismissed as religious bigotry against establishment Presbyterianism. As Commissioner of Lands and in later life Mantell strove to secure the implementation of the agreements he had made on behalf of the Crown. That he and men like him were defeated in the struggle for a just and equitable settlement of the land grievances is understandable. Power lay with the provincial settler lobbies. Why Mantell's contribution to the Maori cause should continue to be seen through the blinkers of that lobby in this day and age is harder to understand.

The paucity and relative unavailability of regional Maori material gives this little book a value which it would not merit in the face of stiffer competition. As it stands it has its uses and its index and notes on sources give it reference value. The extensive record of the Araiteuru Marae development included within it will be its most enduring contribution to Maori knowledge. On the other hand it does offer 'Pakeha Dunedin' the opportunity of discovering the Maori perspectives in the Otepoti landscape, some of the significance in the names that surround it, some of the memories embedded in it. If that opportunity is seized then at least one of the authors can rest content.

STEPHEN O'REGAN

Wellington Teachers College