

Another work of awesome span, although covering a much shorter period, is that of Wiltgen. Here the primary concern is with Oceania as conceived by French and Roman churchmen in the early nineteenth century—that is, as including Australia and New Zealand as well as all the Pacific Islands. In it the activities of the missionaries who worked to plant the Catholic Church in 'the fifth part of the world' are discussed in relation to the rivalries, interests, ignorance (especially of geography), follies and ideals of Vatican officials and superiors of religious orders. Unlike most recent Pacific histories this one is unashamedly—but profitably—'headquarters centred'. With such a focus it reveals patterns of logic and causality that cannot be discerned in the narrower, though more fashionable, 'island-centred' studies. It provides an integrated explanation of a set of operations that ranged from Perth to Honolulu.

A valuable contribution to the history of missions and of the religion, Wiltgen's book is also a fascinating, sobering and occasionally humorous study of bureaucracy at work. For instance, he describes a brilliant hoax in which, in 1824, a twenty-year-old Egyptian student tricked the Vatican authorities into ordaining him sub-deacon, deacon, priest and finally (in the Sistine Chapel with the Pope as celebrant) Archbishop of Memphis—all within the space of fourteen days, on the assurance that this would help re-unite the Coptic Church and Rome. This incident, which led to the hoaxer being sentenced to life imprisonment in a Papal jail, had an impact on the Pacific in 1825. It made Vatican officials refuse urgent—and well-founded—requests for speed in extending formal ecclesiastical jurisdiction to Hawaii.

Welcome for its substance, Wiltgen's book is also to be admired for the lavishness of its production and for readability combined with rare scholarship. It is based on exhaustive archival research, requiring competence in five languages.

In these books Garrett and Wiltgen have contributed to their field of interest not only by adding to knowledge, but by setting standards of professional skill that will be hard to emulate. Both books were published with the aid of generous subsidies (hence the lowish prices). It was money well spent.

HUGH LARACY

University of Auckland

Indians in New Zealand. Studies in a sub-culture. Edited by Kapil N. Tiwari. Price Milburn for the New Zealand Indian Central Association Inc. Wellington, 1980. 244pp. N.Z. price: \$19.50.

A BOOK on Indians in New Zealand has long been overdue and this collection of papers by various writers, edited by Kapil Tiwari, makes a welcome step in filling that gap. Not many New Zealanders, and certainly few people outside New Zealand, are aware of the substantial group of Indians in this country and this introductory survey should provoke some awareness of the diversity of Indian communities there. Another aim of the book, ostensibly, was to provide some documentary history which young Indians could consult to learn of both their cultural heritage and the story of their ancestors' struggles in a foreign land. Indians have been emigrating to New Zealand, mostly direct from specific areas

in the Punjab and Gujarat provinces of India, since the late nineteenth century, but it is still very difficult to obtain any historical information about this important ethnic group in New Zealand.

But the reader will discover that these wider aims and, indeed, Dr Tiwari's title of the book, are misleading. I am sure that if the reader was concerned with finding out information on Indians in ancient India or in the villages there today, that they would be better directed to consult one of the more easily readable paperbacks available on Indian society and religions. One would expect that a book of this nature, particularly when the editor was working in conjunction with Indian residents of New Zealand, would have revealed more about beliefs and practices of religion there. Jim Wilson and James Veitch both provide useful summaries of Hindu and Sikh traditions but what does this tell us about Indians living in Petone or Pukekohe in the 1980s? William Shephard's paper is also very concerned with the beliefs of Muslims but he does relate this to Indian Muslims in New Zealand, as far as his material allowed him to do so. This is useful, and enlarges our understanding, but one fails to understand why the book contains a chapter on Indian Parsis in New Zealand. There are more Indian Christians in New Zealand than the handful of Indian Parsis that emigrated there. This paper by Professor Boyd and Firoz Kotwal stands out as being written with virtually no understanding of the New Zealand environment or of the Indian communities that settled and developed there.

Another serious omission is that very little attention is paid to the economic activities of Indians in New Zealand. Professor McLeod's succinct historical account of Punjabis is an exception, for at least he briefly writes about the economic activities of a few Indian pioneers in New Zealand. (at last! some personalities!) But Punjabis are only a small proportion of the Indians in New Zealand and Tiwari's rambling who's who of the Indian Associations does not provide adequate background to the economic patterns. People familiar with New Zealand have commented on the apparent concentration of Indians in small commercial ventures. In the past this was in fruit hawking and bottle-collecting, today it is in gleaming fruit shops and suburban dairies. This book does not discuss whether this economic stereotype is typical, or really try to account for the preference by some (how many?) Indians involved in these occupations. There are other serious gaps in this book which is, after all, supposed to be a study of a 'sub-culture'. Dr Palakshappa and Ms Kasanji do provide interesting introductions to some of the questions raised about Indian cultures in New Zealand, but do not, in my opinion, really provide much insight into the relevance of caste to this 'sub-culture', or of the relationship of New Zealand Indians with India, or even of the status of Indian women in New Zealand. A final major gap in the book is that it fails to adequately discuss the relationship of Indians to the New Zealand social context. After all—the book is titled 'studies of a sub-culture'. A sub-culture of what? And can we seriously relate all the different papers in the book together and label them a sub-culture? Since a major portion of the book contains historical material collected from members of the Indian Associations, then surely some insightful analysis of their data in the context of New Zealand history would have been of some use?

But what of the material actually contained in the book? There are far too many errors, irrelevancies and endless unnecessary detail which at times reads like tittle-tattle. Do we learn anything from such remarks as, 'Some farmers use rainwater-storage tanks and town water' (p.8)? Dr Tiwari talks of 'hidden pre-

judices', 'culture shock' (p.11), or on another level, 'farming on a lower scale' (p.80)—but what do these terms mean? While one does not want to get involved in the internal politicking of the Indian Associations, it becomes apparent to the reader that rather unnecessary attention is paid to certain individuals.

Grammatical, conceptual errors and personal biases aside, there are still too many documentation errors in the citing of sources in Dr Tiwari's paper in the book. The most serious mistakes were quotations without footnotes (e.g. pp.18, 33, 57), and incorrect sources for quotations (e.g. references on p.16 to *Auckland Star* on 15 April 1922, 19 to 20 July 1922, 13 August 1943 are incorrect). Dr Tiwari also did not do his homework when he cited a figure of 671 Indians being in New Zealand from 1909 to 1920 (p.32), because a quick check will reveal that this figure refers to the number of Indians recorded on the census night in New Zealand in 1921.

Most of this poor historical writing is contained in the editor's own paper, a pity one feels, because much of the data was gathered by Indians who were anxious to have their material written up by an authoritative academic. As I have mentioned, the rest of the book for the major part, contains background on aspects of Indian religions, but the relevance of this to the New Zealand context is not clear. Contributions by McLeod, Shephard, Palakshappa and Kasanji do, however, provide interesting and important summaries of Indian communities in New Zealand—and if the reader is very patient he may find that the major historical survey by Dr Tiwari enlarges his view of the history of some of the Indians in New Zealand.

JACQUELINE LECKIE

University of the South Pacific

Maori Dunedin. By Maarire Goodall and George Griffiths. Otago Heritage Books, Dunedin, 1980. 56pp. N.Z. price: \$5.85.

THIS SLIM volume was originally published to coincide with the opening of the new Arai-te-Uru Marae in the Kaikorai Valley, Dunedin. It is extremely compressed in its geographical coverage in that it is confined to urban Dunedin and its historical dimension from a Maori perspective. The compression does a severe disservice to Otago's Maori history which is essentially coastal and regional in its geographic span. Maori history only makes sense when it is related to its own boundaries. It is in grave danger of becoming a quaint colouring-in of the Pakeha landscape when it is deprived of its own, basically tribal, framework. Despite this intrinsic constraint there is much that is valuable even if only for the reason that it is not readily available in print elsewhere. The material on Maori place names in the Dunedin area is, in itself, sufficient justification for publication. Goodall's interest in the Taranaki-Otakou relationship deriving from the exile of Te Whiti and his followers in the South Island in the late nineteenth century protrudes somewhat. It does not do so unduly, however, and points up the need to see important Maori-Maori relationships in New Zealand history. The preoccupation with Maori-Pakeha relationships too often precludes this. The hospitality of the Otago Ngai Tahu to the Taranaki exiles laid the basis of an enduring set of